Delving into the Impact of Job Match and Remuneration on Burnout and Turnover Intention among Pharmacists in Pakistan

Sheema Matloob, Zohra Bhatti, Hasliza Abdul Halim, Raja Sikander

To Link this Article: http://dx.doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v8-i6/4289 DOI: 10.6007/IJARBSS/v8-i6/4289

Received: 03 June 2018, Revised: 25 June 2018, Accepted: 28 June 2018

Published Online: 06 July 2018

In-Text Citation: (Matloob, Bhatti, Halim, & Sikander, 2018)


Copyright: © 2018 The Author(s)
Published by Human Resource Management Academic Research Society (www.hrmars.com)
This article is published under the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY 4.0) license. Anyone may reproduce, distribute, translate and create derivative works of this article (for both commercial and non-commercial purposes), subject to full attribution to the original publication and authors. The full terms of this license may be seen at: http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/legalcode
Delving into the Impact of Job Match and Remuneration on Burnout and Turnover Intention among Pharmacists in Pakistan

Sheema Matloob, Zohra Bhatti, Hasliza Abdul Halim, Raja Sikander
School of Management, Universiti Sains Malaysia, 11800, Minden Road USM Penang, Malaysia
Email: Sheemamatloob1100@outlook.com

Abstract
This study aims at examining the impact of job match and remuneration on job burnout which subsequently affects turnover intention among pharmacists in Pakistan. A preliminary study was conducted with a sample of five pharmacists in Pakistan. A series of interviews were conducted among five pharmacists working in different hospitals in the Pakistan. The results showed that the pharmacists were likely to be inclined towards turnover intention. This is because most of them perceived that their jobs were not fulfilling enough in terms of job match and remuneration package offered by their employers. In fact, they also experience job burnout that triggered their intention to leave the company. In sum, this study generates initial understanding for the researchers to reach more conclusive evidence on the factors affecting turnover intention in pharmaceutical industry. Keywords: Job match, Remuneration, Burnout, Turnover Intention.

Introduction
Health is a necessity for human being. But shortage of human health professionals has been recognized globally. World health organization [WHO], (2006), declared shortage of human health resource as “Global crisis of health work force” after report which revealed shortage of 4.3 million health professionals those included doctors, nurses, pharmacists and mid wives across the globe (WHO,2006). Moreover, report has identified 57 countries with meager health work force suffering below standard health delivery and Pakistan is one of them. Global inequality between health professionals and burden of diseases lead to worsen situation (Crip & Chen, 2014). The pharmacist plays major role in health industry being behind the scene (Khardori, 2018). The pharmacist role and their need is increasing day by day but their shortage has plunged to 1.9 million (WHO, 2016). For instance, Europe
expects a shortage of 1 million health workers by 2020 which includes 0.19 million pharmacist and physiotherapists. They cover almost all health specialties areas. Pharmacists are expert in different areas like dispensing medications, monitoring of patient health to get their response for therapies and drugs composition (include chemical, biological & physical properties), manufacture and use (Garattini & Padula, 2018). They primarily focus on drug purity, strength and ensure that drugs do not interact in harmful way. Furthermore, they are medication experts ultimately concerned about their patients’ health and wellness. Currently pharmacist role has been extended in many developed countries like two states of USA have allowed independent prescribing of drugs by pharmacist. Similarly, United Kingdom and Australia are also considering to give right to pharmacist for independent prescription. But in Pakistan function of pharmacist in health sector does not clear. In order to serve patients with quality health services, pharmacist role should be integrated in patient care i.e. allow them to work on drug therapy outcome and patient quality care. (S. A. Khan, Qayum, & Sadozai, 2016)

Pharmacists in Pakistan – Status and Shortfall

History has evidence, especially in late 1980s, medical professional such as doctors and nurses contributed for the progress and development of many countries like Great Britain, the United States, Canada, the Gulf region etc. The first pharmacy (general store with pharmacy) (Naqvi et al., 2017) in Sub Continent was established by late Sheikh Nabi Buksh in Gujrat in 1863 (T. Khan, 2011). After the independence of Pakistan University of Punjab was pioneer to introduce the pharmacy program in Pakistan in 1948. (Jamshed, Izham, & Ibrahim, 2009) Furthermore, the latest approved revision (April, 2010) had included few deficiencies in clinical part of syllabus. Although this does not mean pharmacy program is perfectly organized and there is no area of improvement. In Pakistan, PhamDs come across a number of challenges in healthcare system. The resolution of this study is to highlight challenges of pharmacy profession (academic education to career development), so that the HEC and PCP can bring reforms in curriculum that flourish their skills. In addition, they should provide opportunities to Pharmacist will get right place according to academic qualification and their skills and healthcare set up to establish a solid foundation for practicing pharmacist and develop the history of pharmacy. (Jamshed et al., 2009).

According to a report by Express tribune (2015), out of 63,000 community pharmacies, only 9.5% of the pharmacy personnel have received any form of professional pharmacy education. (Express tribune, 2015) Hence, this lack of professionalism, respect and inferior remuneration keep the individuals from opting for community pharmacy as their field of study. A survey conducted in June 2015 by Express Tribune, they found that, 85 per cent of the pharmacists were unwilling to accept their responsibility as community pharmacists and most of the qualified pharmacists were seeking opportunities in the Middle East. Beside this, another issue which intensify such problem of lack of job opportunities for pharmacist in Pakistan. Along with this, another problem reported in Dawn (2016), is lack of awareness of pharmacology, especially in rural areas, due to which job opportunities are very low for pharmacists.

In summary the current study added in the existing literature in theoretical and practical perspective. From the theoretical point of view, the results of the present study have
successfully provided preliminary evidence on turnover intention, thus enriching the available body of literature. Particularly, the literature on job match and remuneration have been inconsistent, therefore, the present study has added in the body of knowledge by providing the preliminary evidence in testing this relationship. Further, current study has also contributed to body of knowledge by providing evidence on mediating role of burn out on the turn over intention. From the theoretical perspective, the results of the current study have delivered evidence in the pharmaceutical industry of Pakistan to authenticate the claim of Social Exchange theory.

Further to practical significance results of current study will be helpful for practitioners, policy makers and hospital management to formulate the policy for reduction of turnover intention. Such level of studies previously was neglected in Pakistan context. So, in contextual perspective current study is first study in nature related to pharmacists’ role in medical care sector.

Problem Statement

“To play an active part in health improvement and help patient to make a best use of their medicine use” mission of Pharmacy Practice in Pakistan. But Pharmacists are still struggling for their career development. Their education is in evolutionary time; pharmacy education was started with three-year bachelor’s program and converted into four years’ degree. Moreover, in 2003 PharmD was begun with intention to meet international standard in Pharmacy and to increase career opportunities for them (S. A. Khan et al., 2016). The results of these efforts have not created significant impact as pharmacists require attention and status in Pakistan hospitals. Result of this negligence is that Pakistan become an export processing zone of qualified health professionals and trained paramedical staff who are leaving the country for pursuing better career and self-development opportunities in world (Dawn, 2012).

Pakistan is suffering from shortage of Pharmacists. According to WHO’s Implementation Strategy Report (2011), Pakistan has need of 62,085 Pharmacists for population of over 170 million but it has only 32511. There is shortfall of 32511 Pharmacist in country. Moreover, WHO report has revealed licensed pharmacists in all sectors in Pakistan are 0.61 to serve 10,000 populations whereas in public sector it is merely 0.092 per 10,000 populations. These numbers clearly indicate to the severe problem of unavailability or shortage of Pharmacist staff. Pakistan Pharmacist workforce density is below one as compare to USA 9 pharmacists per 10,000 and 11 per 10,000 in France. The situation become more complex when all trained pharmacists’ professionals and final year pharmacy students are going to leave the country to pursue jobs in better positions in world (Naqvi et al., 2017).

Beside this, Pakistan is also facing different problems like inequity, resource scarcity, gender insensitivity, untrained human resources and structural management in health profession. Shortage of pharmacist is moving upward as result of short supply of academic pharmacist, like other pharmacy professionals (Azhar et al., 2015). Pharmacists are adapting other profession for their bread and butter to get rid from problems which they tolerate in pharmacy job. Therefore, this study has focused to examine antecedents of pharmacist turnover intention. Meta-analysis of 23 studies on employee turnover prediction,
employees’ perception of alternative profession can predict the actual turnover of employees (Rojanasrot et al., 2017)

Like rest of the world, Pakistan is suffering massive shortage of Pharmacist. In this regard WHO Implementation Strategy Report (2017), Pakistan has a total of 32,511 registered pharmacists. However, the number of practicing pharmacist are still unknown. On the other hand, for a population of over 207.7 million, at least 62,085 pharmacists are necessary. Approximately 49 percent shortage is there due to excessive turnover intension.

Table 2.1
Professional pharmacist’s in Pakistan (Registered) Standards & Shortfalls

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Health Resources</th>
<th>Registered</th>
<th>International Standards required for population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>short fall Percentage</td>
<td>207.7*/170</td>
<td>62,085</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pharmacist (48.67%)</td>
<td>32.511</td>
<td>1/6 doctor</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Economic Survey of Pakistan (2015-2016)

Naqvi et al. (2017) stated that the situation has become more complex and a further shortage of pharmacy professionals is expected to be created as several trained pharmacists continue to leave the country and many final year pharmacy students aspire to move to developed countries after graduation.

Literature Review

Turnover of pharmacist in Pakistan has many reasons. For example, the intention to leave the organization is usually seen as a possible outcome of a negative organizational environment caused by negatively perceived support from the organization. This reduced organizational commitment, may cause the job dissatisfaction, and this job dissatisfaction leads to turnover intension. (Urbonas, Kubilienė, Kubilius, & Urbonienė, 2015)

Sales of medicines along with prescription only medicine (PoM), even antibiotics are being dispensed or sold without the proper prescription of the doctor very easy to access the medicines from the medical stores and pharmacies in majority of the cities and towns in Pakistan. The overall process of prescription handling, history taking and medication counselling is either limited, only few pharmacies offer, or seldom present in majority of pharmacies. (Toklu & Hussain, 2013) Provision of proper records of patients in integrated manner should be maintained and made mandatory by the government at each community pharmacy to serve the society in a better way. (Aslam, Bushra, & Khan, 2012)

In developing countries like Pakistan many of the healthcare professionals & workers are not satisfied with their salaries or other incentives and benefits and the quality of life they themselves or their families spend. They believe that they lack opportunities at various levels of their career. For example, there are not enough opportunities to learn advanced technologies and new skills in a poor working environment. Employees face violence at workplaces and are working under political influence. These aspects of their job demotivate
employees and consequently they try to switch their jobs in developed countries which have a higher pull force. (Naqvi et al., 2017) The resources left behind in these countries facing brain drain are less skilled and dissatisfied with their current jobs. (Matowe, Duwiejua, & Norris, 2004) The shortage of Healthcare service providers is attributed to a number of factors. For example, less people are going for education in health-related subjects, immigration of health workers, turnover intention & change of profession by the healthcare professionals & workers and early retirement as stated in a study done in Africa. (Tasneem, Cagatan, Avci, & Basustaoglu, 2018).

**Turnover Intention**

Turnover intention indicates an employee’s perceived prospect of leaving an organization, or the willingness of an individual to permanently retire from the organization (Austin, Saylor, & Finley, 2017). Abbasi and Hollman (2008) asserts that employee turnover intention is an important affair, especially within the scope of human resources management as turnover intention can be very costly for an organization (Campion, 1991). In other words, when an employee leaves an organization, the ability of the remaining employees to complete their duties will likely to be affected and workload will be doubled (Urbonas et al., 2015). Turnover intention is a serious problem currently faced by the organizations in which employees leave the organization or organization fired them. Employee intention to stay is crucial for better efficiency because employees who feel fulfilled and are happy with their job tend to perform significantly better than those who are not ensuring customer satisfaction and customer loyalty (Lin, Tsai, & Mahatma, 2017). Employee turnover, specifically undesirable turnover increases direct and indirect costs and the loss of intellectual assets of an organization. Hence, managing employee turnover and employee retention are critical priorities for organizations to enhance business growth and sustainability. (Lim, Loo, & Lee, 2017) Turnover intention is a natural phenomenon that takes place when some insufficient planned system and role of work-life dispute occurs, giving rise to the least amount of motivation, performance, promotion, and focusing at the workplace, and thus enforcing the employees disturbing the work breakdown structure to quit the organization. (Bhayo, Shah, & Chachar, 2017)

Previous researches demonstrated that turnover intention is the contemporary situation based on measurement of whether organization’s employees plan to leave their position, or the organization plans to remove employees from their positions. Furthermore, Ezeh and Olawale, (2017) viewed turnover intention as movement of employees around the border of organization. (Ezeh & Olawale, 2017).

**Job Match**

There are a lot of hindrances and obstacles which are currently being faced by pharmacists in the Health Profession. One of the major challenges graduating PharmD pharmacists have to face is the availability of hospital jobs and acceptance of pharmacists in clinical settings by the medical and paramedical personnel (S. A. Khan et al., 2016). According to Campion, (1991) that job match means that qualification and the job description of the candidate appropriately match each other. It also reveals that the level of work fulfillment would
increase if it encompasses and take into account the exact match between the candidate’s qualification and experience and occupation work. It is most effective in terms of performance if the job is appropriately matched with what the aspirant desired and what the organization needed. “approximately one half of the staff who intended to leave their jobs within a year cited an incorrect match as the result of the turnover” ust be resolved from one by one turnover or an exchange and this might be so costly for the organization to repeat the same procedures for recruitment and selection process (Thomas, Strickland, & Gamble, 2006).

As indicated by (Reilly, et al., 1991) candidates who agree on any position in the organization which could not be matched with their actual qualification and expertise typically do not stay in the long term and they are not much productive for the firm also. (Thompson, et al., 2006). Saidu Expresses that “a contented employee is the real asset for the firm productivity” (Saidu, 2018). Discrimination among health professionals is the second most importance issue being faced by pharmacists. Doctors and other health professionals discriminate pharmacists, deal them as paramedical but in real they possess the same level qualification. In Pakistan no jobs are given to pharmacists and no preference is given to them as compared to doctors. On the contrary, in other countries, due consideration is given to them in and their services are considered critical for improvement of health sector services, added the PPA office-bearers (PPA, 2018).

**Remuneration**

Compensation is categorized into two parts, named as direct financial compensation which is in the form of salaries, wages and commission etc. Salary refers to periodical payment made to the employees having a definite guarantee, on the other hand wage refers to the remuneration paid under the agreement of payment (Candra, Hana, & Wulandari, 2018) . Level of remuneration has a higher correlation with leaving intention as compared to other dimensions i.e. affective commitment, (A’yuninnisa & Saptoto, 2015). This outcome concludes that pay level is more significant in respect of turnover intention in a way that employees’ desire to quit the job and get another opportunity gets raised. Besides, the author claims that there is moderate and negative correlation among pay level and turnover intention where pay raise satisfaction has less significance as compared to pay level satisfaction (Ezeh & Olawale, 2017). It means those employees who are happy with their pay level are most satisfied and they do not intend to find other opportunities and to quit their current role, generally. In the other words, this study claims that turnover intention has both direct and indirect impact on satisfaction of pay level whereas the level of turnover can be brought down by insuring attractive increment system in pay structure. (Candra et al., 2018).

In an Express Tribune report (2015) it was stated that out of about 63,000 community pharmacies, a very small number of pharmacy personnel (9.5%) received any form of formal pharmacy education. Therefore, all this discouragement which intakes less remuneration, respect and inferiority complex have made it a least preferred option to be taken as field of study. In June 2015 a survey was conducted which stated that a large number; 85 per cent
of the pharmacists are not willingly accepting their responsibilities and a large number out of them are trying to seek opportunities in foreign countries specially in Middle East (Express Tribune, 2015). There is another intense issue which states that there are not better work openings for Pharmacists. Another issue was reported in Dawn (2016), is a large number of people, particularly in remote areas are unaware of pharmacology and this causes very less number of opportunities.

**Burnout**

This word refers to an observation among those who work in Human service workers who have to deal with emotionally demanding individuals. Since then, most of the burnout studies have been based on Maslach and Jackson’s (1986) conceptualization of burnout. (Jackson, Schwab, & Schuler, 1986). The definition they gave of burnout have three types components; emotional exhaustion (feelings of being overextended and depleted of emotional and physical resources), depersonalization or cynicism (negative or excessively detached responses to various aspects of the job), and diminished personal accomplishment (feelings of incompetence and a lack of achievement at work). Frameworks of burnout related to theory Demerouti & Bakker, 2001 state that the key mediator of relationship among chronic job match and less remuneration various attitudinal outcomes is burnout. (Demerouti, Bakker, De Jonge, Janssen, & Schaufeli, 2001). Turnover intention has been empirically supported as key outcome of burnout from these previous researches (Huang, Chuang, & Lin, 2003).

**A Framework for understanding Turnover intention**

Based on the literature discussed above, a conceptual framework has been developed to understand further on the impact of job match and remuneration on burnout which subsequently affecting turnover intention. Figure 1 exhibits the conceptual framework.
Methodology
This study embarks on the exploratory research in order to determine the nature of the problem. This type of approach is not intended to provide final evidence, but assists researcher to have a better understanding of the problem. A series of interviews were conducted among five pharmacists from different Health Care Units (Hospitals, Pharmacy Colleges, etc.) in Lahore, Pakistan to obtain their understanding and opinion based on their experiences on the factors affecting turnover intention. Lahore is the capital of the province of Punjab, the second largest and most populous city in Pakistan with 7.2 million inhabitants and 81.17% urban settlement (Hashmi et al., 2017). There are 3618 registered license pharmacies in Lahore (Health Department Punjab, 2016). The pharmacist were chosen as the unit of analysis due to their involvement in monitoring the patient health, which requires them to be more committed and engaged with their profession (Azhar et al., 2015). In fact, the relationship between pharmacist and patients also involves high interpersonal or emotional demands, which can lead pharmacist to experience high levels of burnout.

Findings
The findings of this initial study highlight the basic issues pertaining to the factors affecting burnout and subsequently on turnover intention. This will offer valuable preliminary insights on the issues of burnout and turnover intention in pharmaceutical industry in Pakistan.

a) Job Match and burnout (Theme 01)
Job match is very important to ensure that the qualifications of the pharmacist match their job tasks (Reilly, Chatman & Caldwell, 1991). In fact this may disclose that levels of work fulfillment would improve if it has a solid match involving the candidate’s identity with the occupation work (Saidu, 2018). A remark stated by the respondents are given in tabular form.
Table 1
Response from respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Respondent</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Is the job according to the qualification and expectation of the employee so it will reduce the turnover intention among the pharmacists”</td>
<td>I am doing job as a pharmacist. whereas the practicing scope of the pharmacy entirely different which is described in books or practice in developed countries</td>
<td>Yes, I got the job soon after completion of my pharms. D, which was as per my qualification and expectation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1st</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2nd</td>
<td>I am performing my job however; the job description doesn’t match with that of written in the advertisement of the job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3rd</td>
<td>I am giving my services in a hospital where I am not being respected by the doctors as I deserved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4th</td>
<td>My work has a solid matched with my Qualification and expectation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5th</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

b) Remuneration and Burnout (Theme 02)

Table 2
Response from respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Respondent</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Discrimination among the health professionals in terms of remuneration creates the major cause of turnover intention among the pharmacist</td>
<td>I am working so hard however I don’t get the reward as per my work which ultimately makes me emotionally exhausting from my workplace that ultimately affect my job performance</td>
<td>I am getting the same salary package that other organizations offered in market. I am quite satisfied with my remuneration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1st</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2nd</td>
<td>I am not quite satisfied with my remuneration because it’s not been given as competitive market offered</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3rd</td>
<td>Salary is quite low that becomes the reason of burnout</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4th</td>
<td>Receive the same remuneration and benefits which are getting by other health professional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5th</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

c) Burnout and Turnover intention (Theme 03)

Table 3
Response from respondents
In burnout (emotional exhaustion and depersonalization) directly influence in the turnover intention of the pharmacists

1st
Of course, I have faced the burnout situation when the things are going against to me, that trigger me to think about intention to move as I will get better opportunity in any other country

2nd
Unfortunately this profession is not groomed as it is in the foreign countries, so the personality development and professional skills are demolished which makes the cause of turnover intention

3rd
Obviously, my job is according to my qualification however, protocols rules and regulations are not follow that triggers me to think about intention turnover

4th
In my complete job tenure, I never think about the turnover intention since my organization paid me according to my work along with other perks and benefits

5th
No any intention to leave my Organization

The findings revealed that pharmacists who are working in different hospitals and pharmacies in Pakistan are likely to have turnover intention. In this manner, majority of them realize that their jobs are not satisfying and rewarding as a result, they experienced burnout in their job behavior which push them to have intention to quit and subsequently looking for appropriate alternatives that may offer a perfect job match with relevant skills and expertise as well as attractive remuneration package.

**Discussion and Conclusion**

The shortage of pharmacists in Pakistan is very alarming in which the findings showed that most of the respondents had the intention to quit from their current position. This severe issue has becoming very glaring for the healthcare industry. This situation also affects the productivity of the pharmacists that indirectly affect the performance of the healthcare sector. As such, this study is timely to dwell further on the factors that elicit turnover intention among the pharmacists in Lahore, Pakistan. As such, the findings indicated that the main factors which have major influence on turnover intention namely job match, remuneration, and burnout. These factors have proven to affect burnout in which the pharmacist experience long term job stress. It also involves mental, emotional, or physical exhaustion, frequently accompanied by an overwhelming sense of hopelessness. Consequently, they felt dissatisfied and start to have intention to quit their current job.

In spite of the easy availability of the pharmacies and community pharmacists (CPs). However, there is a dire shortage of recognition of pharmacists as a healthcare provider by other stakeholders (physicians, nurses, paramedics) of healthcare system in Pakistan. (Hussain, Malik, & Toklu, 2013)
Consistent with the preliminary findings, it can be deduced that unmatched job and remuneration were the important factors that affect burnout that ultimately give impact to turnover intention. Importantly current study has tried to highlight the importance of the relationship between job match, remuneration and burnout with turnover in tension among pharmacists in Lahore, Pakistan. In connection to this, current study is proposing to put full attention towards job match requirements and proving good remuneration package which may reduce job burnout and also could reduce the turnover intention. Attractive remuneration system, job match requirement, good and proper hiring process, and more interactive environment should be built in the hospitals to reduce burnout and turnover intention.

References


