The Impact of Sandtray Therapy in Group Counseling towards Children’s Self-Esteem

Gooh Mo Lee, Ku Suhaila Ku Johari, Zuria Mahmud, Linda Jamaludin

To Link this Article:  http://dx.doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v8-i4/4132  DOI: 10.6007/IJARBSS/v8-i4/4132

Received: 27 Feb 2018, Revised: 17 March 2018, Accepted: 07 April 2018

Published Online: 08 April 2018

In-Text Citation: (Lee, Johari, Mahmud, & Jamaludin, 2018)


Copyright: © 2018 The Author(s)

Published by Human Resource Management Academic Research Society (www.hrmars.com)

This article is published under the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY 4.0) license. Anyone may reproduce, distribute, translate and create derivative works of this article (for both commercial and non-commercial purposes), subject to full attribution to the original publication and authors. The full terms of this license may be seen at: http://creativecommons.org/licences/by/4.0/legalcode
The Impact of Sandtray Therapy in Group Counseling towards Children’s Self-Esteem

Gooh Mo Lee, Ku Suhaila Ku Johari, Zuria Mahmud, Linda Jamaludin
Faculty of Education, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, 43600 UKM Bangi, Selangor, Malaysia.
Corresponding Author: moleegooh@gmail.com

Abstract
This study is based on experimental design by making a comparison between control group and experimental group based on the pre and post test results. The objectives of the study are to identify the effect of sandtray therapy towards the improvement of the five self-esteem variables: general, social, family, academic, and lie. The subjects of the study were children aged 11 years old (n = 32) in Malaysia. The subjects were divided into two groups namely the sandtray group (n = 16) for the experimental group, who received sandtray therapy compared to control group (n = 16) who did not receive the treatment. The self-esteem inventory test will be drawn from Coopersmith (1967). The data were analyzed using SPSS version 22, Manova Recurrent Measurement, pre-test and post-test. The results of the Pillai Trace multivariate test showed that the main effects of the main variables of the post-test were F (5, 11) = 41.372, p <.05. Results from the Sphericity Assumed on table 1.6 below, pretest and posttest of general self-esteem shows F (1, 15) = 49.853 α<.05. The results towards the social self-esteem shows F (1, 15) = 63.646 α<.05, to the parental self-esteem F (1, 15) = 82.924 α<.05, to the academic self-esteem F (1, 15) = 80.071 α<.05, and to lie self-esteem F (1, 15) = .732 α>.05. The findings of this study specify that Sandtray therapy is a valuable therapeutic intervention to enhance the child’s self-esteem. Several recommendations were presented to parents, teachers, school administrators and Ministry of Education Malaysia were discussed in promoting children’s wellbeing.

Keywords: Sandtray Therapy, Group Counseling, Children, Self-Esteem

Introduction
Counseling in schools has been seen to have a significant impact on children’s mental well-being (McLaughlin and Holiday, 2014). However, counseling for children is different from counseling with adults (Geldard & Geldard, 2002). Homeyer & Sweeney (2011) stated that children do not communicate in the same way that adults do because children do not have the cognitive or verbal maturity to communicate in counseling in the way as adults’ converse. Therefore, counselors face difficulty in carrying out counseling sessions with children as children faced difficulties in
expressing their emotions verbally, will tend to be silent and will try to avoid touching important issues during conventional counseling (Geldard & Geldard, 2002).

Landreth (2012) specified that children often lack cognitive ability to express their concerns verbally. Therefore, counselors can use sandtray therapy as a psychotherapy technique in counseling sessions so that counseling sessions become more creative, interesting and effective. The sandtray therapy approach is an effective counseling approach for children and able to form a therapeutic relationships between children and counselors through the natural language of children playing (Landreth, 2012). Thus, counselors can use the sandtray therapy approach during the counseling session as one of the interventions to enhance the child’s self-esteem. Sandtray therapy is a multidimensional form of play therapy that utilizes a tray partially with sand and a large collection of miniature (Bernstein, 2007; Zarzaur, 2004; Homeyer & Sweeney 2011). Children choose miniatures from a collection and build scenes in the sandtray as an expression and representation of their inner worlds (Homeyer & Sweeney 2011).

**Problem Statement**

Children are the most important part of each society. There is no doubt that they are facing some problems nowadays such as divorce in the family. The number of divorces in Malaysia has more than doubled in just eight years from 2004. In 2012, a whopping 56,760 divorces were recorded, which is equivalent to marriage breaking down every 10 minutes (Ministry of Women, Family and Community Development Malaysia). The National Registration Department also recorded a rising divorce trend between non-Muslim couples from 2008-2012 (from 6,573 to 9,020 cases). Amato(2010) in his research shows that among effects of divorce on children are negative emotions like bitterness, stress, emotional pain, anxiety, fear, feeling abandoned, feeling betrayed and loss of self-esteem. Self-esteem plays an important part in all aspects of a child’s development. The term self-esteem relates to a person’s overall emotional assessment of his or her worth and a person’s sense of pride and is closely related with his or her self-consciousness and psychological well-being (Olsen et al., 2008).

Hence, a person’s self-esteem may be dependent upon his or her psychological adjustment, the quality of life, adaptive behavior, relationships with friends, motivation, school performance, and success in life (Papadopoulos, Metsiou, & Agaliotis, 2011; Saigal, Lambert, Russ, & Hoult, 2002). Low self-esteem may proceed if there is a disagreement between a person’s expectations and his or her perception of capability. According to Michie, Glachan and Bray (2001), the differential estimates for children can affect mental health, psychological well-being and interpersonal behavior. Children are easily overwhelmed and have low self-esteem. They prefer to be silent and are afraid to ask the teacher. Their academic achievement is also less satisfactory. Thus, effective intervention in counseling session is immediately necessary to help the children for their social and emotional development. Hence, counselors can use the sandtray therapy approach during the counseling session as one of the interventions to develop the child’s self-esteem.
Literature Review
Toys are like the child's words and play is the child's language (Landreth, 2012). Thus, sandtray therapy helps children to express their experiences and desires. Therefore, the sandtray therapy approach has been widely used in Western countries such as the United States and it is a new approach for counseling process in Malaysia (Carey 1999; Draper, Ritter and Willingham, 2003). Studies on the efficacy of sandtray therapy have been widely carried out in Western countries. For example, studies by Flahive (2005), Flahive and Ray (2007) and Shen (2008) have studied the effectiveness of sandtray therapy approaches on students with behavioral problems using experimental methods. The findings show that there is a significant change in the behavior of clients undergoing sandtray therapy. Even sandtray therapy has also helped children to overcome trauma of divorce (Draper, Ritter, & Willingham, 2003). The study by Baker and Gerler (2008) emphasizes that sandtray therapy is considered as an effective school counseling modality to address the needs of primary school children. Sandtray therapy has also enabled school counselors to help students in their growth and development (Ray, Armstrong, Warren & Balkin, 2005). Homeyer and Sweeney (2011) identified sandtray as a popular therapy among therapists because it allows children to communicate non-verbally when facing problems. Research on play therapy was done by Ku Suhaila et al; 2014 investigated the effectiveness of Child-Centered Play Therapy by conducting 3-day training sessions in different part of Malaysia for a total of 116 participants including mental health students and practitioners. The findings prove that play therapy has a great impact in enhancing the competency of mental health professionals in Malaysia.

Research Objective
The objective of the study is to identify the effect of sandtray therapy towards the improvement of the five self-esteem variables: general, social, family, academic, and lie.

Method
The following section will present the research design, participant, procedure of data collection, instrument, and data analysis of this study:

Research Design
The research design in this study is experimental by making a comparison between control group and experimental group based on the pre-and post-test results. Researcher divided the participants into two groups; an experimental group and a control group. Both groups completed the Self-Esteem Inventory (pre-test) but only the experimental group went through the sandtray therapy. After they have done the counseling sessions using sandtray therapy approach and answered the SEI post-test (Flahive, 2005; Zarzaur, 2004; Ye-seul Yang, 2014; Mok-Hwa Park & Mi-young Lee, 2013: Ju-young Maeng & Mikyoung Jang, 2014). From that, the researcher was able to evaluate the impact of the application sandtray therapy in the counseling through the comparison of experimental group and the control group.

Participant
The subjects of the study were children aged 11 years old (n = 32). The purposive sampling technique was used in this research. There was a total of 32 participants with low self-esteem in
the study. The subjects were divided into two groups namely the sandtray group (n = 16) for the experimental group, who received sandtray therapy compared to control group (n = 16) who did not receive the treatment. Demographic background included the frequency and percentage of gender, race, and parental relationship.

Table 1. Frequency and Percentage of the demographic background (n=32)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malay</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parental</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single mother</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single father</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most of the respondents were Malays (n= 26, 81.3%, followed by Chinese (n= 3, 9.3%), Indian (n= 2, 6.3%) and others (n=1, 3.3%). Most parents of these respondents (n= 15, 49.9%) lived together as a married couple, 3 (9.47%) lived as single mothers, none for single father and 14 (43.7%) divorced.

Procedure of Data Collection
The data collection included pre-test and post-test for all participants and intention using sandtray therapy for treatment group. The participants responded to questionnaire two times which before and after treatment given to experimental group. The experimental group received one hour sandtray therapy sessions for eight weekly and the control group did not received the therapeutic intervention during the experimental phase of the study. Researcher used the sandtray therapy guidelines from Homeyer & Sweeney (2011) to ensure that the collective procedure of conducting sandtray therapy will be followed: room preparation, introduction to participants, creation of sandtray, post-creation and sandtray clean-up. The researcher has set up a room that is suitable and conducive for the sandtray therapy to be conducted with a variety of miniatures consist of people, animals, buildings, transportation, vegetation, fences, natural items, fantasy, spiritual-mystical, landscaping, household items and miscellaneous items. The researcher has also provided sufficient trays filled with dry or wet sand. Eight weekly sandtray sessions was determined be an adequate amount of time to show the
behavior change in children as reported by the previous studies in sandtray therapy (Plotkin 2011).

The researcher utilized in the sandtray therapy session summary obtained from Homeyer & Sweeney (2011), which will be completed for every session of each group that included the details of the session: to note down the number of session, the length of time the participants do the therapy, to include picture of the sandtray the participants created, to know how the participants make the tray and the use of any water, and miniatures.

Once participants were identified and consent/assent forms were signed, pre-test data was collected by giving the Self-Esteem Inventory to participants’ in both the experimental and wait-list control groups. After pre-test data was collected, the sandtray therapy process began within eight weeks. The participants in the experimental group were divided into two groups and underwent eight weekly 60 minutes group counseling sessions using sandtray therapy approach. Two counselors were assigned for each group. Participants in the wait-list control group did not participate in therapeutic intervention during the experimental phase of the study. Sandtray therapy sessions were administered to the control group after the experimental phase of the study was completed and post-test data was collected from all participants. The participants in the control group were informed that their participation in sandtray play therapy sessions would begin approximately eight weeks after they completed the consent and assent forms. In order to document and monitor participant activity during sandtray play therapy sessions, the researcher recorded participants’ behaviors and comments on the sandtray session summary forms and took a digital photograph of the participant’s final sandtray scene at the end of each session. The sandtray session summary form records (a) participants’ approach to task, (b) description of sandtray, (c) sandtray themes, and (d) description of figures used. Participants’ approach to task includes (a) whether the child had an easy or difficult time getting started with the process, (b) if he or she was determined or hesitant to create a scene in the tray, and (c) whether or not the child was fully involved in the sandtray session (Homeyer & Sweeney, 2011).

Description of sandtray includes (a) whether the child placed the figures in the tray in an organized or chaotic manner; (b) if the figures were placed in the sandtray and were moved around or if they remained in the same position; (c) if the child left the tray empty or with few figures, used an adequate number of figures to create a scene, or used an excessive amount of figures creating a crowded space in the sandtray; and (d) if the child created one complete idea or separate ideas within one sandtray scene. Sandtray themes include information about the scene children create during each session. Themes reflect whether the child’s scene included peaceful, nurturing, protective, aggressive/violent, conflicted, withdrawn, loss, fantasy, secretive, abandonment, helpless, or power/control elements. Peaceful scenes tend to be harmonious without conflict, while nurturing scenes include aspects of support or caring. Protective elements shield or defend. Aggressiveness/violence refers to hostility or an attack. Conflicts tend to be depicted as a disagreement or argument in the scene. Withdrawal relates to departure from activity by figures in the scene. Loss can refer to death or defeat. Fantasy scenes use imagination and are unrealistic.
Instrument and Data Analysis
The self-esteem inventory test will be drawn from Coopersmith (1967). The self-esteem inventory test will be drawn from Coopersmith (1967). Coopersmith’s SEI consists of five subscales: general, social, family, academic, and lie self-esteem items. These items are to be answered with “like me” or “unlike” and for each items, it will be scored as one. SEI has proven to be reliable as it has had considerable uses by researchers. The SEI developed by Coopersmith has been used in a number of studies and proved its reliability. According to Heatherton (2003) found that Coopersmith’s SEI are the best scales to analyze factors, following their test on eight measures of self-esteem. Correspondingly, students’ journal from Plymouth University stated that the test-retest reliability of Coppersmith’s SEIs shows range from .88 (over five week period) to .70 (over three year period). The data were analyzed using SPSS version 22, Manova Recurrent Measurement, pre-test and post-test. This study will be carried out by using pre and post-test design based on the self-esteem inventory (SEI) test.

Findings
The first research question is “Is there any effect of sandtray therapy towards the improvement of the students’ self-esteem?” This was measured by the responds given by the respondents in experimental group through the questionnaire which consists of 58 items. In order to find out whether sandtray therapy can improve the respondents’ self-esteem, several statistics application will be used to analyse the results of pre-test and post-test of experimental group.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2 Descriptive statistics analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Experimental</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 shows the mean differences of self-esteem variables (general, social, family, academic, and lie) of experimental group in the pre-test and post-test results (n=16)

As a whole, it shows that sandtray therapy improve all the self-esteem variables in the post-test, from the pre-test. The items under family self-esteem variables acquired the highest mean difference between pre-test and post-test with .8359 (3.9453 - 3.1094). The items under academic self-esteem variables acquire the second highest impact that gives mean difference of .7891 (3.8438 - 3.0547). It is followed by social variables of self-esteem with mean difference
.7422 (3.6094 - 2.8672). Second lowest effect of self-esteem variable as a result from sandtray therapy is general self-esteem. It gives a mean difference of .2332 (3.3005 - 3.0673). Consequently, lie scale for the experimental group is the lowest among all variables with mean difference .102 (2.9453 – 2.8437). Overall, the self-esteem variables give mean difference of .5403, with post-test 3.5288, and pre-test 2.9885, of experimental group.

The second type of analysis is MANOVA multivariate test analysis. It is used to further understand whether there are differences between the pre-test and post-test of experimental group, which indicates the effectiveness of sandtray therapy by understanding the impact it, has towards the variables of self-esteem. The MANOVA test analysis is shown in the table 3

| Table 3 Multivariate measure of pre and post-test of experimental group (n=16) |
|------------------------------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| Within subject effects           | Value | F     | Hypothesis df | Error df | Sig. |
| Pillai's Trace                     | .950 | 41.372c | 5.000       | 11.000   | .000 |
| Wilks' Lambda                      | .050 | 41.372c | 5.000       | 11.000   | .000 |
| Hotelling's Trace                  | 18.805 | 41.372c | 5.000       | 11.000   | .000 |
| Roy's Largest Root                 | 18.805 | 41.372c | 5.000       | 11.000   | .000 |

Based on the Table 3 Manova multivariate test for pre-test and post-test of experimental group indicates within-subjects of self-esteem variables. The pre and post- test results from the findings show that the overall Pillai’s Trace F (5, 11) = 41.372, p<.05. This shows that the use of sand tray therapy, has significantly affected the self-esteem variables of experimental group in the pre and post- test results. Pillai’s trace is being used due to its reliability in multivariate measures. It offers greatest protection against Type 1 errors with small sample size. It also sums up and calculates the variance in the dependent variables which are accounted for by the greatest separation of independent variables.

Next, the third type of analysis is univariate test which reveals the sphericity assumed of the pre-test and post-test results of experimental group, as shown in table 4. Basically, Sphericity Assumed refers to the similar one variance difference between levels of repeated measures. In other words, the analysis calculates the difference between each levels of repeated steps and then calculate the variance and the score difference Sphericity Assumed requires that the variance for each set of score are the same.

Results from the Sphericity Assumed on Table 4 below, pretest and posttest of general self-esteem shows F (1, 15) = 49.853 α<.05. The results towards the social self-esteem shows F (1, 15) = 63.646 α<.05, to the parental self-esteem F (1, 15) = 82.924 α<.05, to the academic self-
esteem F (1, 15) = 80.071 α<.05, and to lie self-esteem F (1, 15) = .732 α>.05. This indicates that sandtray therapy gives significant effect to four of the self-esteem variables in pretest and posttest of experimental group, except for lie self-esteem. Therefore, as can be seen from mean difference in table 4 of the descriptive statistics analysis, it shows the differences in pre-test and post-test, where all self-esteem variables improve except for lie self-esteem. Although, Pillai’s Trace shows overall statistically significant effects of sandtray therapy towards the self-esteem variables, but when it comes to univariate test, specifically to each self-esteem variables, it shows that all except lie self-esteem are significantly affected by the use of sandtray therapy.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>Type III Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-test &amp; Post-test</td>
<td>Low self-esteem</td>
<td>Sphericity Assumed</td>
<td>.435</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.435</td>
<td>49.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quietness</td>
<td>Sphericity Assumed</td>
<td>4.407</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.407</td>
<td>63.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Shyness</td>
<td>Sphericity Assumed</td>
<td>5.590</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5.590</td>
<td>82.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Anxiety</td>
<td>Sphericity Assumed</td>
<td>4.981</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.981</td>
<td>80.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sadness</td>
<td>Sphericity Assumed</td>
<td>.083</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.083</td>
<td>.732</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**

This recent study sought to determine whether sandtray therapy has a positive effect on the child in terms of low self-esteem, quietness, shyness, anxiety and sadness. The findings of this study showed that the null hypothesis is thus rejected, because there is a significant effects of sandtray therapy that can be seen in the self-esteem variables between the pre-test and post-test results of the experimental group.

Thus, the results and findings show an increase in all of the self-esteem sub-variables. Sandtray therapy has effects to all the self-esteem variables, where in the post-test, all of the self-esteem variables are higher than the pre-test. Moreover, the multivariate measure shows significant effect of the sand tray therapy to the self-esteem variables with Pillai’s Trace F (5, 11) = 41.372, p<.05. While the univariate test for each self-esteem variables, except for lie (.406, p >.05) also shows significant effects. The findings proved that sandtray therapy is effective in improving children’s self-esteem. These findings also supported previous research on the effectiveness of sand tray therapy in helping children’s adjustment following parental divorce by (Plotkin 2011). Results from her research indicated that children who participated in sandtray therapy following parental divorce showed significantly less internalizing and externalizing behaviour problems compared to children who did not participate in sandtray therapy during the experimental phase of study.
Landreth (2012) also agreed that the process of change that occurs in children through sandtray therapy can establish a positive relationship between peers and families, children can express emotions and strengthen their self-esteem. Even Ku Suhaila (2015) agreed that counselors are able to help children with the use of sandtray therapy approaches, and therapeutic relationships can help clients in terms of emotions. Drews (2009) in his study, said that play is one of the most effective ways to express feelings that are hidden. Therefore, children in primary school will show their feelings or share events that affect their lives through play.

Furthermore, sandtray therapy is best suited for children from various cultural groups. Flahive (2005), Flahive and Ray (2007) and Shen (2006) have studied the effectiveness of sandtray therapy approaches on students with behavioral problems using experimental methods. Participants in the experimental group underwent a 10-week sand tray therapy while participants in the control group did not receive sand tray therapy intervention. The findings showed that there are significant changes to clients undergoing sandtray therapy.

In addition, Shen & Armstrong (2008), using the similar design as this study, in examining the use of pre-test and post-test control group with young adolescent girls using group sandtray therapy, found that there is significant improvement in the adolescent girls’ self-esteem in the treatment group than the control group.

Crenshaw and Steward (2016) also agreed that sandtray therapy provides an opportunity to process life experience through a tangible, visible procedure which is fun and intensely meaningful, both intimately revealing and meaningful. The process of healing takes place while playing with the sand and figures. The tray captivates for fear and anger as the feelings are discovered the scenes.

Conclusion
The result in this study showed there is a significant effects of sandtray therapy that can be seen in the self-esteem variables between the pre-test and post-test results of the experimental group. The findings of this study also support previous literature which indicated that sandtray has been beneficial in helping children to develop their self-esteem.

Acknowledgement
I would like to express sincere gratitude to Dr. Ku Suhaila binti Ku Johari and Prof Dr. Zuria binti Mahmud from Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia for their suggestions and guidance in the writing of this manuscript.

Corresponding Author
Gooh Mo Lee, Faculty of Education, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, Malaysia.
Email: moleegoo@gmail.com

References


