Equivalence in the Translation French-English in the Film Subtitles "Les Intouchables"

Khairul Anuar Mohd Jasni, Hazlina Abdul Halim

In-Text Citation: (Jasni & Abdul Halim, 2022)
To Cite this Article: Jasni, K. A. M., & Abdul Halim, H. (2022). Equivalence in the Translation French-English in the Film Subtitles "Les Intouchables". *International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development. 11(2),* 1578 - 1588.

Full Terms & Conditions of access and use can be found at
http://hrmars.com/index.php/pages/detail/publication-ethics

Equivalence in the Translation French-English in the Film Subtitles "Les Intouchables"

Khairul Anuar Mohd Jasni[1], Hazlina Abdul Halim[2]

[1]Department of Foreign Languages, Faculty of Modern Language and Communication, Universiti Putra Malaysia, [2]Department of Foreign Languages, Faculty of Modern Language and Communication, Universiti Putra Malaysia
Email: gs63515@student.upm.edu.my, hazlina_ah@upm.edu.my

Abstract

Translation as a concept of transposing the context and meaning to another language, in order to reach the same level of equivalence. This research attempts to classify the categories of equivalence found in the subtitle translation of the film *Les Intouchables* and to analyse the dominant strategies used by the translator to achieve equivalence in subtitle translation. The sample of this study is the English subtitles of the film *Les Intouchables*. The study uses Nida's (1969) approach on equivalence and Catford (1964) to analyse the strategies to achieve the equivalence in the translation. Overall, this research collected and recorded 251 data that utilized the three strategies to achieve equivalence, which are addition strategy, deletion strategy and category shifts. The addition strategy is the most used, which amounts to 136 data or 54.18% of the overall. For addition strategy, addition of statement is mostly used, accounting to 32.25 % of overall addition strategy, followed by addition of interrogative statement (20.59%) and imperative statement (12.5%). It was found that the addition strategy is very useful in further elaborating the meaning of the subtitles to ensure the context of the dialogue is comprehensible to the audience. Meanwhile, the translator opted for deletion strategy to avoid redundancy, but the impact of the original dialogue is lost. As for the category shift, it is used to avoid miscomprehension among the audience due to cultural difference between the English and French language. It is hoped that future research would explore the used of strategies and equivalence on other languages, to see the similarities and the differences in the translation of other languages.
Keyword: Equivalence, Addition Strategy, Omission Strategy, Category Shift

Introduction

According to Larson (1984), translation is basically changing a text from the source language into the target language. Catford (1965) clarified that translation is the replacement of textual material in other language, while Bell (1991) defined the phenomenon as "the replacement of a representation of a text in one language by a representation of an equivalent text in a second language". From these definitions, it can be concluded that equivalence is an element in rendering the source text (ST) and the target text (TT) similar in meaning and interpretation.

Baker (2011) further stated that equivalence as the relationship between a source text (ST) and a target text (TT) which allows the TT to be considered as a translation of the ST in the first place. Soku (2010) viewed translation as a concept in language is about meaning, which refers to words, speeches, and written texts that has been put into one language from another. Rees (1974) sees translation as the rendering of something written in one language into another which does not misinterpret the meaning or sacrifice the feeling of the original.

Literature Review
In view of the use of translation, subtitling and dubbing are the two elements that the audiences require when they watch any foreign movies or drama. O'Leary (2005) stated that certain countries such as France and Italy preferred dubbing the foreign films instead of subtitling in their native tongue. To further reiterate, in a study done by Dutka (2003), audiences found it tiresome and wearying to read through the translated subtitles particularly when they are watching an action movie. Nevertheless, it is generally accepted that dubbing can become unsuitable as it is not always sin sync with the movement of the lip. Hence, it is the job of the translator to appraise the grammatical structure between source language (SL) and the target language (TL), if it concludes that it is terribly conflicting, then dubbing will surely not suited in that case.

Carroll & Ivarsson (1998) stated that it is quite arduous to sustain the distinctiveness among 'the rhythm of the film' and the character' speech if the lines belonging to a particular culture. This 'culture-bound is frequently found in many foreign movies. Hence, some audiences may find it difficult to comprehend as they are quite unaccustomed with the others' culture. Nedergaard-Larsen (1993) argue that it is quite demanding to translate subtitles to match the language with the culture. Thus, to avoid this uncertainty, the viewer would require a further explanation in subtitles, nonetheless, if it was done there will be no synchronization anymore, claimed (Thomas, 2007).

Equivalence is one of the translation strategies that is used by most translator when translating other's works. This strategy has been applied countless times throughout the realm of translation. However, finding equivalence may not be as easy and can be extremely complicated, translator thus use different kinds of approaches to achieve the equivalence strategy. According to (Munday, 2008), there are a few types of equivalence which can be divide to formal equivalence and dynamic equivalence. Formal equivalence focuses more on the message of the source text that should be associate as much as possible to the target language. Dynamic equivalence on the other hand refers to the principle of equivalent effect of which signifies to achieve the closest natural equivalent to the source language message.

To achieve the equivalence in translation, Munday (2008) outlines four basic requirements of a translation, which are making sense, conveying spirit and manner of the original, having a natural and easy form of expression, and producing a similar response. Hervey & Higgins (2002) suggest that the 'equivalent effect implies sameness seems to be more of a hindrance rather than a help'. Hence upon consideration of a translation by 'an equivalent target-culture situation', it does not automatically mean the translation require to have specific components that belong to any translation theory. In actuality, it signify that, to translate using non-identical words but also keeping the conformity elements between source language (SL) and target language (TL).

Due to semantic, socio-cultural, grammatical differences between both the source and target language, the loss and addition of information in translation is unavoidable. Hence, Bell (1991) suggests a similar point that 'something' is always lost or, one might suggest, gained in the process, which according to Nida (1975), involves "all types of translation involve loss of information, addition of information, or skewing of information". To conform to the stylistic demands and grammatical conventions of the target language, structural adjustment in translation is inevitably needed.

With regards to skewing of information, Catford (1965) brings the idea of shift, namely 'the change of formal structure of the source language into the target language'. Catford (1965) classified the translation shift into two major types of shift which are identified as : level shift and category shift. However, this research will only be focusing on the category shift. Category shift is any change from the formal correspondence in translation. Category shifts are divided into four types, which are, structure shift, unit shift, class shift and intra system shift.

a. Structure Shift
Catford (1965) refers to structure shift as shift in translation that involves the changes of grammatical structure between source text (ST) and target text (TT). Furthermore, it is also known as structure shift when the arrangement of the sentence structure is changed upon translating the source text.

b. Unit Shift
Catford (1965) mentioned a unit shift occurs when translation equivalent of a source text unit at one rank in is a unit at a different rank in the target language. This includes shifts from morpheme to a word, word to phrase, clause to sentence and vice versa. Catford (1965) further divided the unit shift is into two categories, which are :

- <u>Low level to Higher level</u>
This level occurs when the unit category of ST contains only one word, but it comes to more than that after it was translated into the TT.

- <u>High level to Lower level</u>
This level occurs when the unit category of ST contains more than a word but then it becomes less than that after it was translated into TT.

c. Class Shift
Catford (1965) stated that class shift occurs when the translation equivalence of an SL item is a member of a different class from the original item. It is a change in word class. Catford (1965) mentioned that structure shifts entail class shifts, since it is 'logical dependence of class on structure'. Word class, which is also known as part of speech comprises of 8 classes, which are verb, adverb, noun, pronoun, adjective, preposition, conjunction and determiner.

d. Intra-System Shift
Catford (1965: 80) asserts that intra-system shift refers to a situation where both ST and TT have close proximity equivalence system but the translation contains a 'non-equivalent term in the TL system'.

Untranslatability is a property of text and utterances in one language, for which no equivalent text or utterance can be found in another language when translated (Sankaravelayuthan, 2020). Though French and English language, though related in a sense, have a lot of words which are the *faux-amis* (false friends). These words though shares similar phonetic forms, have a completely different meanings. Apart from that, some phrases, if directly translated, do not convey the connation and the intended meaning of the actual phrases.

Research Questions
Researcher's main questions for conducting this research is,
1. What are the categories in the equivalence found in the film " *Les Intouchables*" and its subtitle translation?
2. What is the dominant strategy used by the translator to achieve equivalence in subtitle translation?

Limitation of Study
This research will only limits to identifying the subtitle translations that used the equivalence strategy through addition, deletion and category shifts in the film *Les Intouchables*, which runs for a duration of 1 hour and 52 minutes.

Methodology
The research analyses subtitles of the French film, *Les Intouchables*, which was directed and produced by Olivier Nakache, Eric Toledano, Nicolas Duval Adassovsky, Yann Zenou and Laurent Zeitoun will be use as a sample for this study. The full duration of this movie is 1 hour 52 minutes or 112 minutes, thus the result of this study will be based on the subtitle of the film. Since the main topic of this study is concerning the subtitles, thus the method for data collection utilize the transcription of the movie subtitles. The approach used to analyse the said data is the descriptive qualitative method. The French language that is use as the main spoken language in this entire film will be labelled as a Source Language (SL), meanwhile the subtitles of this film that is fully translated into English will be labelled as the Target Language (TL).

Theory and Conceptual Framework
The study utilized Nida's (1975) and Catford (1964) theory in order to answer the research questions, which involve:

1. Addition
   Adding an extra information may be imperative when translating the source text (ST) into target text (TT), but it depends on the context. If the translator surmise that by adding the text would be better, he may add them.

2. Deletion
   In line with Ivacovoni (2009), deletion or usually refers to 'omission' denotes 'dropping a word or words from the source language (SL) whilst translating'. He further stated that this mechanism happens due to 'cultural clashes that exist between the source language (SL) and the target language (TL)'.

3. Category Shifts

Catford (1964) mentioned that category shifts are used when the linguistic form between target language (TL) does not equal to one another. Conventionally, this tactic involves altering the structure of a phrase without altering the intended meaning of the source language (SL) in order to accord the audience a greatest understanding. This strategy comprise of 4 types of shift; (1) structure shift, (2) unit shift, (3) class shift, (4) intra-system shift.

Procedures

The first procedure to execute out this study is to transcribe the spoken dialogue of the entire film with the help from the French subtitle in order to acquire the most accurate and precise transcription, although, the spoken language is given the most weight here, meaning that verbatim dialogue will be consider more than the subtitle. Next, the English subtitle will then be transcribe alongside the French subtitle. The next procedure is then to compare both transcriptions in French and English simultaneously. This part of the process is necessary in order for researcher to fully grasp how the translation was done and to fully immerse oneself in the studied sample. Later on, the subtitles will be classified into several categories, those categories are, addition, deletion and shifting strategy. After all that has been done, researcher will the divided each category into several smaller categories according to which one of the data belongs to. For instance, category shifts strategy will be divides into several types of shifting categories, 4 to be exact, those are, (1) structure shift, (2) unit shift, (3) class shift and finally (4) intra-system shift. The following number of data is then tabulated and calculated for each of the category to be analyse which one was used most frequent by the movie translator in acquiring the movie translation.

Result and Discussion

Overall, the researchers found that the translator employed the 3 strategies : addition, deletion and category shift, in order to achieve equivalence translation in the movie. There are 251 data collected, of which 136 are the addition strategy (54.18%), the deletion strategy, which amounts to 86 data (34.26%), and the category shift strategy, with 29 collected data (11.55 %) of the overall figures.

No.	Strategies employed to achieve equivalence	Number of data/frequency	Percentage (%)
1.	Addition	136	54.18
2.	Deletion	86	34.26
3.	Category Shifts	29	11.55
	Total	251	100

Analysis of Addition Strategy

Based on the given data above which had been collected along this study, it is noted that there are 136 of which belongs to the addition strategy (54.18%). The translator employed the addition strategy by adding extra information or input in order to facilitate the audience in understanding the film. Along this study, researcher has noted that there are several categories of addition that were utilized by the movie translator which can be summarized as such:

Table 2
Frequency of addition categories

No.	Categories of addition	Number of data /frequency	Percentage (%)
1	Statement	44	32.35
2	Interrogative	28	20.59
3	Imperative	17	12.50
4	Adverb	15	11.03
5	Exclamation	11	8.09
6	Noun	8	5.88
7	Adjective	5	3.68
8	Conjunction	5	3.68
9	Pronoun	2	1.47
10	Verb	1	0.74

Based on Table 2 before, we can see that in category of addition strategy, the most dominant category is addition of statement, which comes was tally with 44 out of 136 data, accounting to 32.25 % of overall statistics regarding the addition strategy, followed by addition of interrogative statement (20.59%) and imperative statement (12.5%). Meanwhile the least recorded in the data on the category, falls to the verb category, with only 1 recorded data (0.74%).

Below are several examples of data or subtitles hat was employed the addition strategy:
Table 3
Examples of Addition strategy in subtitled translation

Source Text	Target Text	Added phrase(s)/subtitles	Type of Addition
Tu poses tes mains sur le capot	**Shut your mouth** and put your hands on the hood!	Shut your mouth	Imperative
Concrètement, je ne sens rien du cou à la pointe des orteils.	**You may not realize,** but I feel nothing from my neck to my toes	You may not realize,	Statement
Et les 1584édecins ?	And the doctors? **What do the doctors say?**	What do the doctors say?	Interrogative

Based on the first examples provided above, the translator added the imperative "Shut your mouth!" into the subtitle translation, although in the source test does not contain it. In this scene, Driss was being told by a police officer to get out of his car, but instead of following the command, he continue on babbling as if trying to fool the police officer. This scene happen on the early stage of the movie.

Next, the second examples given are the addition of a statement. The sentences "You may not realize…" is uttered by Philippe to Driss as if to state the obvious, because Driss was talking as if he didn't know the physical condition of Philippe, who is a paraplegic. In essence this line was spoken by Philippe as more to a sarcastic statement.

Furthermore, the third example is the addition of interrogative. In this scene, Driss was asking Philippe about the opinion of his doctors regarding his future. Although he only uttered the line " Et les Médecins?" which translated to "And the doctors?", the translator

add another line which is "What do the doctors say?", as to imply the meaning of Driss full question.

In conclusion, this results, support the past research done by Septiani (2013) on the equivalence strategy in the translation of the novel Hunger Games into Indonesian. Furthermore, this strengthen the fact that addition strategy is very useful in further elaborating the meaning of the movie subtitle to make sure the audience does not lost in translation.

Analysis of Deletion Strategy

Regarding deletion strategy, the researchers observed there are 86 out of 251 data which utilised the deletion strategy (34.26%). The researchers also noted that the noteworthiness of employing this strategy so to avoid redundancy as well to as to achieve equivalence. This is due to the fact that subtitle translation requires to be inserted within the time frame. It is therefore crucial for subtitlers to omit the superfluous input. Just as the addition strategy that we have just went through, deletion strategy is also segregated into several categories which has been recorded meticulously :-

Table 4
Frequency of deletion categories

No.	Categories of deletion	Number of data / frequency	Percentage (%)
1	Conjunction	16	18.60
2	Imperative	12	13.95
3	Statement	11	12.79
4	Exclamation	10	11.63
5	Noun	10	11.63
6	Adjective	8	9.30
7	Interrogative	7	8.14
8	Verb	7	8.14
9	Adverb	5	5.81
	Total	86	100

As shown in Table 4, the most prominent category of deletion strategy that was employed by the translator is the conjunction category (18.60%). Contrary to that, the least dominant that was utilized in deletion category is deletion of adverb, with only 5 recorded data (5.81%). Parallel to the addition strategy, some of deletion strategy data or subtitles has also been selected for further elaboration :-

Table 5
Examples of Deletion strategy in subtitled translation

Source Text	Target Text	Deleted phrase(s)	Types of Deletion
Montre tes mains! Tes mains **bordel** *!*	Let's see your hands! Your hands!	bordel !	Exclamation
Attendez. *Il faut le sangler* **Je ne sais pas,** *le 8 ou le 9*	You have to strap him eight or ninth	Attendez. Je ne sais pas	Imperative Statement

In this research, to detach superfluous input and to circumvent redundancy, omission or deletion is necessary. In the first example, the translator omitted the exclamation "*bordel*!". This scene occurred in the beginning of the movie when Driss car was blocked by police officers and was told to get out of his car and stop talking. The translator decided to omit this exclamation and simply translate "Your hands!".

Next, the translator also omitted the imperative "*Attendez*" in this scene where Driss was still in-training to be the helper for Philippe. He was told to try and carry Philippe to his wheel-chair although he manage to do so, due to being new to his duty, he forgot to strap Philippe securely, hence was told by Yvonne to make sure he strap him securely. The translator may omit this because the next line "*Il faut le sangler*" which means "You have to strap him" was already explanatory in itself.

Finally, the third example which is a statement that was deleted by the translator is "*je ne sais pas*". This particular scene happened when Driss and Philippe was having conversations about their history and background and in the midst of the moment Philippe inquired to Driss about the date. To which Driss replied guessingly, hence he said "*je ne sais pas*", but the translator opted to omit this line as to avoid redundancy.

Analysis of Category Shift

It is noted in this film, that the translator employed category shift strategy at 29 instances, which amounts to 11.55% of the total strategy. Category shifts occur when the linguistic form of the two languages does not match. Hence, altering the sentence structure of the target text without altering the meaning of the source text can be achieve by employing several types of category shift, which are structure shift, unit shift, class shift and intra-system shift. The essence of employing this mode is to accord the utmost comprehension to the audiences as occasionally the literal translation of the source language may turn out to be very strenuous to understand.

Category shift strategy as the other two strategies, is also segregated into several data :-
Table 6
Frequency of shift categories

No.	Categories of Shift	Number of data / frequency	Percentage (%)
1	Unit shift	12	41.38
2	Structural shift	8	27.59
3	Intra system shift	5	17.24
4	Class shift	4	13.79
	Total	29	100

As shown in Table 6, the most dominant category shift employed by the translator in *Les Intouchables* is the unit shift, which recorded 12 (41.38 %), while the least employed category is the class shift, with only 4 data (13.79%). The examples along with the analysis of subtitles that employed category shift is shown below:

Table 7
Examples of Shift strategy in subtitle translation

Source Text	Target Text	Types of shift
Tu veux un grec ?	Let's get a kebab	Intra system shift
c'est comme un talkie	It's like a walkie-talkie.	Class shift
C'est bien.	Ok	Unit shift

As stated in the first example of Table 7, intra-system shift was applied here by the translator for the subtitle "*Tu veux un grec?*" spoken by Driss to ask about something that he wants to eat. The translator also shows great knowledge in French culture as several European country also refer "kebab" the food as "*grec*" like the French. Hence if the line were to be translated literally, "Let's get a Greek" it will become very weird and inadvertently confusing the audience.

Next, on the second example, class shift is employed by the translator in this subtitle. The word "talkie" in English may denote some who fond of speaking, but in this sense we knew that when the character, Yvonne, was explaining his equipment to Driss, she meant the communication device, "walkie-talkie". It is of course a noun thus this line falls under the class shift.

Finally, the last example is the unit shift, to be specific, high level to lower level. This level occur when the unit category of the source text contains more than a word and becomes less after translated into the target text. In this line we can clearly see that Philippe was responding to Driss question about accelerating his motorized wheel-chair, to which point the translator employ the unit shift category in translating Philippe's respond. It is thus falls under the Higher Level to Lower Level category. The inference that can be made from this explained data is that this also support the research that was done by Septiani (2013) as previously mentioned.

Dominant Strategy Employed to Achieve Equivalence

It is generally assume that despite each strategy that was infer to be utilized by the translator must bear concrete justification and to meet unequivocal motivations. It is thus the primary rationale to attain equivalence. Hence, each strategy, addition, deletion and category shifts have its very own incrimination in terms of its practicality and efficacy that cater for each translation.

Overall, researcher has collected and recorded 251 data that utilized the three strategies to achieve equivalence. Addition strategy has the most data (136 usages or 54.18%), while deletion strategy accumulate 86 recorded data (34.26%) on the statistics. Finally the last strategy which is category shifts, only carries 29 data (11.55%) which is the least used of all the three strategies. On the foundation of the findings and data, it is more than prudent to say that this research has successfully answered all the research questions that had been put forward. After lengthy analysis, an abridgment of the total research can finally be conclude that addition, deletion and category shifts were utilised by the translator to achieve the equivalence. However, by using the deletion strategy, the original impact of the dialogues was erased and thus the target text did not convey the situational context to the audience. Hence, translators should be careful of the singularities of the source and target languages in order to produce an accurate equivalent of the text. Translators should be made aware of the fact

that any possibility of misinterpretation of the source text can alter the intended mood and the meaning of the subtitles' films.

Recommendation

Based on the findings and data from this long and tedious labour research, it is crucial that we give credit to the translator of foreign movies in providing equivalence subtitled translation, so as to give the audience an enjoyable and satisfactory movie experience. It is noted that without proper translation of subtitle, the audience may not fully grasp and comprehend the target movie. This endeavour is also critical so as to raise awareness among people on the notions and ways of how subtitle translation truly works.

It is thus the recommendation of researcher that this field study be further explore and understood, so as to provide better equivalence in translating foreign movie subtitles. It is also hoped that future researchers would be more expand the research to other languages as well, to see the similarities and the differences of the strategies used in the translation of other languages.

References

Baker, M. (2011). In Other Words: A Coursebook on Translation. (2nd Ed.). Routledge.

Carroll, M., & Ivarsson, J. (1998). *Code of Good Subtitling Practice. (1st Ed).* European Association for Studies in Screen Translation.

Catford, J. C. (1965). *A Linguistic Theory of Translation*. Oxford University Press.

Larson, M. L. (1984). *Meaning-Based Translation: A Guide to Cross-Language Equivalence*. University Press of America.

Munday, J. (2008). *Introducing translation studies theories and applications*. Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.

Nedergaard-Larsen, B. (1993). Culture-bound problems in subtitling. *Perspectives, 1* (2), 207-240.

Nida, E. (1975). *Language Structure and Translation.* Standford University Press.

Nida, E. A., & Taber, C. R. (2003) *The Theory and Practice Translation*. E.J. Brill.

Rees, B. R. (1974). Some Thoughts on Translation at http://www.jstor.org.

Sankaravelayuthan, R. (2020). Lexical Gaps and untranslatability in Translation. *Language in India, 20*(1), 56-82.

Septiani. (2013). *Equivalence Strategy Used In Translating The Hunger Games Novel Into Indonesian*. Bachelor's Degree thesis, Muhammadiyah University of Surakarta.

Soku, D. (2010). *French-English Translation : Theory and Practice*. Ghana Universities Press;