Vol 13, Issue 12, (2023) E-ISSN: 2222-6990

A Systematic Literature Review on the Perceptions of Year four ESL Primary School Pupils on the Usage of Quizlet in Improving English Vocabulary Skills

Kirthana Tanabalan & Harwati Hashim

Faculty of Education, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia Corresponding Author's Email: harwati@ukm.edu.my

To Link this Article: http://dx.doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v13-i12/19726 DOI:10.6007/IJARBSS/v13-i12/19726

Published Date: 02 December 2023

Abstract

Technology has revolutionized online education systems, offering exciting prospects worldwide. Teaching has changed greatly since the technology was introduced. Higher education institutions have actively adopted technology into their instructional procedures, while basic schools remain wary. Despite modern technology and fast internet in many Malaysian schools, many still lack equipment and use it inefficiently. This study explores fourth graders' views on using Quizlet to improve their English as a second language vocabulary. This research investigated twelve primary school pupils. The teacher taught vocabulary using Quizlet. Interviews with small cohorts of students, one-on-one interviews, classroom observation, and document review provided data. The study used Burnard's analytical methods to assess participants' views on Quizlet's impact on English vocabulary learning. The participants liked Quizlet for language learning. Quizlet was liked by users for its many benefits. This study emphasizes the need for technology integration training for instructors, especially ESL teachers, to improve students' vocabulary learning. Quizlet is a technology application that improves vocabulary, especially for English learners.

Keywords: Quizlet, English as Second Language, Vocabulary Skills, Technology.

Introduction

In English as a Second Language (ESL) learning, it is difficult for pupils to learn and remember new words. Having a strong collection of words is extremely important for understanding and expressing oneself in different languages. Using computers and other digital tools to teach language has opened new ways to teach words and vocabulary. Out of all these new things, Quizlet has become very popular among ESL teachers and pupils. This research looks at what fourth-year ESL pupils think about how helpful Quizlet is in helping them learn more English words (Tran & Nguyen, 2023).

Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

Good communication in English is very important for ESL pupils to be successful in school, work, and social situations. In the world of English as a Second Language (ESL), learning new words is very important. Traditional methods of learning, such as memorizing facts repeatedly or doing the same exercises repeatedly, may not be engaging or effective. By integrating face-to-face medium of teaching with online learning options, hybrid or blended learning is one such opportunity to deliver interesting learning experiences to pupils (Singh et al., 2021). The rise of websites like Quizlet has brought a new way of learning that is more hi-tech and tailored to individuals.

Quizlet is a website that provides different tools to help improve your vocabulary. These tools include flashcards, puzzles, and quizzes. This platform helps students make and use their own study tools to learn new words more easily. Flashcard-based vocabulary acquisition has long been recognised and practiced in either L1 or L2/foreign language study (Waluyo & Bucol, 2021). Interactive features such as audio pronunciations, definitions, and the ability to share study sets encourage active participation in learning new words. Understanding what fourth-year ESL pupils think about using Quizlet to strengthen their English vocabulary is very important because Quizlet is widely used and has many advantages.

When teaching ESL pupils new words, it is very important to listen and understand their thoughts and opinions. Pupils' personal beliefs, values, and experiences have a big impact on how interested and motivated they are in their learning. In Skattenborg's (2020) study, educators found Quizlet was beneficial when used appropriately. It was useful for repetition, encouraging students, and modifying the teachings. Students also said Quizlet was stimulating and varied their learning experience (Skattenborg, 2020)

Research Objectives

This systematic literature study aims to investigate how fourth-year ESL pupils feel about using the website Quizlet to acquire new words in English.

The following goals will be covered in the analysis Exploring Learners' Perceptions

This objective includes a comprehensive examination of the suppositions and perspectives of fourth-year ESL pupils with respect to the adequacy and esteem of Quizlet within the setting of lexicon securing to investigate how Quizlet helps in improving ESL pupils' vocabulary skills.

Assessing Vocabulary Skill Enhancement

The study will moreover look at the degree to which Quizlet contributes to the change of lexicon aptitudes among ESL learners, especially in terms of their understanding, maintenance, and application of unused words.

Research Questions

Based on the research objectives, the following are the research questions for the study. This study seeks to find answers to the following research questions:

- (a) What are the pupils' perceptions towards Quizlet in vocabulary acquisition?
- (b) How does using Quizlet help pupils in improving their vocabulary skills?

Literature Review

The development of a learner's English vocabulary is an essential component of English as a Second Language (ESL) instruction since it has a direct bearing on the pupils' capacity to

Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

comprehend and engage in productive communication. As a result of advances in technology, digital tools have become increasingly widespread for use in the classroom as resources for vocabulary training. Quizlet is one example of such a tool; it is an online learning platform that provides a range of games and other study resources for the purpose of learning and reviewing vocabulary. The purpose of this comprehensive literature study is to investigate the views held by ESL pupils in their fourth year on the effectiveness of using Quizlet to improve their English vocabulary abilities. The purpose of this study is to identify common themes, trends, and findings relating to ESL pupils' opinions of the usefulness of Quizlet as a tool for improving vocabulary by evaluating research that has already been conducted (Abdullah Al-Malki, 2020).

Effectiveness of Quizlet in the acquisition of Vocabulary

Multiple studies have demonstrated that students in their fourth year of learning English had favourable attitudes towards the website Quizlet. They view it as a helpful tool for boosting their ability to communicate more effectively in English. Convenience and easy access are two perks that are frequently mentioned. Pupils are no longer restricted by time or place while using Quizlet since it allows them to access study resources at any time and from any location. The platform's interactive elements, like as flashcards and quizzes, are extremely engaging and motivate pupils to take an active role in the process of vocabulary acquisition and while having fun (EFFECTIVE METHODS TO INCREASE VOCABULARY IN ENGLISH AS A, n.d.)

Pupils of English as a second language in their fourth-year benefit from greater engagement and motivation when they have access to resources that are convenient and easy to obtain. They value the intuitive design of the platform's interface, which makes navigating the site and gaining access to learning resources more quickly and easily. Quizlet is useful for pupils who wish to engage in independent study since it enables them to construct individualised study sets and review terminology at their own speed. The fact that the platform may be accessed from a variety of devices contributes to the platform's already impressive level of accessibility and adaptability.

Improved vocabulary retention is another stated benefit of Quizlet. Many year four ESL pupils indicate that utilising Quizlet helps them retain and recall terminology more efficiently. The frequent exposure to words through flashcards and quizzes assists in solidifying word meanings and spelling. The auditory element, which allows learners to listen to word pronunciations, boosts their pronunciation abilities as well (Avisteva & Halimi, 2021).

Restrictions in using Quizlet

Despite the good opinions, various obstacles and restrictions related with Quizlet usage have been found. Technical challenges and limits are major concerns among year four ESL pupils. Problems with accessing or loading study materials, hiccups in the interactive features, or compatibility issues with various devices or operating systems might all fall under this category. The learning process might be derailed by technical difficulties, which in turn lowers the level of happiness that pupils have with the platform.

Another possible drawback is that Quizlet only offers a limited number of personalization choices. Year four ESL pupils may require more customised approaches to vocabulary study, adapted to their unique requirements and preferences. The capacity to modify study sets, adjust exercises to specific learning styles, and include extra resources may be vital for

Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

effective vocabulary training. Some learners expressed a need for additional interactive elements and various exercises to enhance their vocabulary learning experience on Quizlet. Concerns have also been raised over the possibility of an excessive dependence on memorising rather than a deeper knowledge of the meanings and applications of individual words. Quizlet's flashcards and quizzes largely focus on learning vocabulary items, which may lead to a surface-level grasp of terms. Since the exercises on Quizlet frequently do not include contextual signals or examples, it is possible that some pupils will have difficulty applying the language they have learned in real-world settings. It is essential for teachers to enhance the use of Quizlet with instructional practises that foster analytical thinking, stimulate critical thinking, and promote the application of language to real-world scenarios (Brittingham & D'Amico, 2022).

Methodology

As illustrated in Figure 1, eight systematic literature review approach is used as recommended by Xiao and Watson (2019) to perform this investigation.

		_
	Step 1: Formulate the problem	
Planning the Review	Step 2: Develop and validate the review protocol	
	Step 3: Search for literature	
	Step 4: Screening for inclusion	
	Step 5: Quality Evaluation	
Conducting the Daview	Step 6: Data extraction	
Conducting the Review	Step 7: Data analysis and synthesis	
Reporting the Review	Step 8: Reporting findings	

Figure 1: Process of systematic literature review.

The procedure is divided into three primary stages and eight steps. The first stage involved determining the necessity for a review and creating the review methodology. The goal of the study, research questions, search methodologies, inclusion and exclusion criteria, synthesis, and reporting were all identified at this stage.

The review was then began by looking for relevant publications in a database called Google Scholar. The database was searched for peer-reviewed research studies or publications written in English and published between 2016 and 2022. At the same time, inclusion and exclusion criteria were tested, as shown in Table 1.

Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

Table 1

Criteria that should be included and excluded

Inclusion criteria	Exclusion criteria
Participants in the research should be in primary school.	The study's participants were in secondary and tertiary education.
Research from multiple countries.	Researchers from a country.

All of the papers were extensively reviewed so that the data from the articles could be retrieved, evaluated, and synthesised to address the review's two research questions. Finally, the review's findings were tabulated, including references, the research's purpose, study samples, and study results.

Findings

In this review, 10 articles were chosen from the year 2016-2022 were chosen based on the two research questions. The findings are tabulated in Table 2.

Study	Instruments	Aim	Samples	Findings
		Aim The goal of this study is to look into the usefulness of utilising the Quizlet application as a medium for enhancing students'		Findings The results demonstrate that using the Quizlet Application to enhance students' motivation to study vocabulary is successful. Students were more excited, did
		enthusiasm to learn vocabulary.		not get bored fast, and consequently showed a high level of interest when learning vocabulary using the app. They also completed the tasks in the programme on their own.
(Abdullah Al- Malki, 2020)	Students took pre- and post-tests, completed four self-reflection tasks after each Quizlet class, were observed	Funding Twenty Students aged 18 and 19 who were learning English took part in the research. They were at the Foundation Program's Level	Twenty Students aged 18 and 19 who were learning English took part in the research.	This research is important because it can add to the growing body of knowledge in the field of English Language Teaching (ELT) about 21st century strategies

	T	T	T	<u> </u>
(Avisteva &	in class, and participated in focus groups after the final Quizlet session to provide data for this study. In addition, the researchers used the Google classroom app to keep track of the students' progress and to record their observations and notes.	B, the pre- intermediate stage. However, pupils had to complete a Placement Test that evaluated their vocabulary, reading comprehension, and writing skills before being admitted to Level B.	Students from	for improving language learning in the classroom. It's also crucial for English professors and their students to experiment with new approaches to vocabulary instruction and study.
(Avisteva & Halimi, 2021)	posttest.	new language may have a small vocabulary. Because of this issue, they are unable to use and comprehend a large variety of foreign language speech and writing. The issue is exacerbated since many educators are unaware of the best practices for teaching vocabulary to students of foreign languages.	Bengkulu's Senior High School X were the subjects of this research. There was a total of 30 students included in this study, 22 of whom were female and 8 of whom were male. This study was carried out throughout the 2019-2020 school year.	study add to our understanding of how best to put Quizlet to use as a tool for vocabulary acquisition.
(Brittingham & D'Amico,	The participants	The purpose of this research is to	Seven undergraduat	This study found that immigrants
2022)	were eighth	examine how	es took part in	benefit from using
	graders at Boiling Springs	new ESOL students can	the research. There was one	Quizlet to acquire vocabulary in
	Middle School	benefit from	sixth-grader,	language 2 by

who were	using the	one seventh-	matching it	to
enrolled in	multimedia	grader, and	vocabulary	in
Newcomer	learning	three eighth-	language 1,	but
ESOL lessons.	platform Quizlet	graders. These	only if they	can
	to improve their	pupils were	read in their	first
	English	identified as	language.	
	vocabulary.	ESOL		
		beginners		
		because their		
		WIDA scores		
		were between		
		1 and 2. All of		
		the students		
		were either		
		Russian,		
		Ukrainian, or		
		from		
		Honduras.		
		There are		
		three Spanish		
		speakers and		
		four Russian		
		speakers		
		among the		
		students.		
		Their average		
		I-Ready		
		reading ability		
		is between		
		that of a first-		
		grader and a		
		kindergartene		
		r.		

(Dizon 2016)	The are and	This research	Thoro wore	Parcaived
(Dizon, 2016)	The pre- and post-tests showed statistically significant learning increases. According to a researcheradministered questionnaire, students liked using Quizlet to learn L2 vocabulary.	This research looked at how well the online flashcard platform Quizlet worked for improving second-language English vocabulary.	There were nine Japanese university students who were studying English as a foreign language. Over the course of 10 weeks, the students used Quizlet to study academic vocabulary from Coxhead's (2001) AWL.	Perceived usefulness, perceived ease of use, and behavioral intention to use Quizlet all obtained mean scores above 4 on a 5-point Likert scale, suggesting high agreement. These findings support Quizlet in EFL classrooms
(Fithriani, 2021)	Online questionnaires , pre- and post- tests, and SPSS 20 were used to collect data.	This study randomly assigned two classes of 74 first-year students attending a General English course at a state university in Indonesia to experimental and control groups.	This quasi- experimental study examined 1) the effects of gamified vocabulary acquisition in a mobile- assisted language environment on Indonesian adult EFL learners' vocabulary learning outcomes and 2) their views of its advantages.	In the recent decade, research on EFL gamification's educational benefits has grown. These studies have shown inconclusive efficacy.

/T - ^	1. (1.)	Th	FO !! ! :	CI de la
(Toy & Buyukkarci, 2020)	In this study, questionnaires and field notes were used to collect student feedback about Quizlet. In order to collect student feedback, a questionnaire with sixteen separate questions is distributed to them.	The goal of this research is to determine how useful Quizlet is as a tool for expanding students' second-language vocabulary. In order to gauge how students value Quizlet's vocabulary-building features for their own learning.	50 participants	Students' active and passive vocabulary improvements after therapy were shown. Students comprehensible vocabulary has risen but not productive vocabulary. The majority of students who have used Quizlet for study have given it great marks. They all said the program was useful and easy to use. This study improved students understanding of how to use Quizlet to acquire vocabulary.
(Sanosi, 2018)	Pre and post test	The primary purpose of this research was to investigate how using the Quizlet app affected vocabulary learning for lower intermediate EFL students. The study's overarching goal is to determine whether or whether the vocabulary-building effects of utilizing Quizlet—an online and	they were evenly divided between two groups (one was the "experimental group," and the other was the "control group"). Lowlevel EFL (English as a Foreign Language) students	The participants in the experimental group who had prior experience using Quizlet shown a significant improvement in their vocabulary knowledge as a consequence of this intervention, as seen by the posttest results. The control group, who did not have access to the program, exhibited much less progress compared to the other test subjects.it showed

		mobile-friendly app—are considerably larger than those of using more traditional methods of education.	both categories.	that quizlet had significant impact to improve the vocabulary of students.
(Barr, 2016)	Quizzes including fill-in-the-blank questions through the use of Quizlet's flashcards, conveniently accessible on this Web 2.0 platform.	The study aims to determine whether or not using digital flashcards is beneficial by comparing the test scores of those who used them with people who did not use them in the same class who were required to acquire the same vocabulary.	There were a total of 32 students in this Quizlet-based research, 15 male and 17 female.	Data showed that students who used the program's gapfill flashcards performed better on tests that included recycled fill-in-the-blank contents from the flashcards available on this Web 2.0 application, and performed somewhat better on tests with new contents for the same vocabulary.
(Kose & Mede, 2016)	The students were instructed to study and practice the vocabulary questions for three weeks without utilizing Quizlet. Online platforms provide weekly responsibilities to pupils. These activities incorporate exercises from previous weeks' studies. The vocabulary	The purpose of this research is to assess how utilizing the online website Quizlet influences vocabulary acquisition among Turkish EFL students in a preparatory program at a private university in Istanbul, Turkey.	43 students in Pre-Intermediate who were transitioning between Pre-Intermediate and Intermediate.	The great majority of students thought the online tool was helpful, especially in the beginning stages of learning new words by reviewing their meanings, synonyms, and pronunciations in the L2.

Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

tests were given before and after the therapy, and the results were compared. The above procedure was used to collect data. Along with classroom observations and interviews, student records were examined to determine
determine
students'
perceptions on the online tool.

Discussion

The discussion stage of the systematic literature review (SLR) provides a fundamental framework for understanding and analyzing the findings derived from the reviewed literature. By providing a detailed analysis of the recommendations, characteristics, limitations, and wider significance of the findings, this field emphasizes the importance of rigorous investigation. Based on a concise summary of the current findings, it is crucial to engage in critical investigation and interpretation. The study examines the outcomes of the subjects in terms of hone, hypothesis, and technique, while also considering the applicability of the findings in real-world contexts and addressing any potential limitations or gaps. The evaluation of the methodological rigor, quality, and representativeness of the literature is essential and should be supported by impartial acknowledgment of possible biases and limitations.

The act of comparing and contrasting discoveries with pre-existing hypothetical systems enhances the discourse, shedding light on the many levels of comprehension and disagreement within the current body of knowledge. The practice of promoting the utilization of underutilized roadways through solicitation and diverse viewpoints fosters cognitive engagement and the evaluation of existing beliefs. Furthermore, the modification of outcomes in many settings beyond the SLR enhances their applicability, hence bridging the gap between scholarly insights and practical implementation.

Users of Quizlet were, as expected, able to reuse previously learned material on examinations, and they also showed promise in their capacity to extrapolate better with new content than non-users. You may access the Quizlet system at this link. It is important to remember, however, that none of these research compared exactly like groups (Barr, 2016). According to Sanosi, (2018), there is a strong correlation between the widespread adoption of information technology and Quizlet's popularity as an e-learning tool. Because of this, it's

Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

clear why Quizlet is so helpful for pupils looking to expand their vocabularies. Newer generations of pupils are accustomed to relying on internet-connected smart devices for the vast bulk of their day-to-day tasks. In addition, Quizlet is a great platform for active learning that can be used in and out of the classroom. In comparison to similar platforms, this is a major selling point. As a result, pupils realize that learning is an active cooperative process in which they are expected to share information and trade answers to vocabulary problems with other groups of pupils in a competitive atmosphere. Pupils benefit greatly from the collaborative learning experiment afforded by the live learning mode in the classroom. However, Quizlet's flashcards and study sets are designed with independent learners in mind. Pupils may find the process of learning new terminology more interesting if they are given a wide range of exercises to do and their progress is regularly assessed. Given its features and the results of this and other studies, Quizlet looks to be a promising resource for both students and educators in the realm of vocabulary instruction and learning.

Implications

Studying how fourth-grade ESL (English as a Second Language) pupils in elementary schools feel about using Quizlet to expand their English vocabulary might have a variety of implications. Teachers can benefit from hearing the perspectives of pupils learning English as a second language (ESL) in order to evaluate the usefulness of digital resources like Quizlet for vocabulary development. In order to better their pupils' language acquisition, teachers can use this data to more effectively include a variety of teaching tactics in their pedagogical practices. The research findings might influence how we teach English to non-native speakers. Teachers could consider adding other digital resources to aid in the growth of their pupils' vocabularies if pupils have positive perceptions of Quizlet. Positive Quizlet reviews might encourage schools to invest in further educational software. Negative feedback, on the other hand, might indicate that the tool's presentation to pupils needs to be tweaked or that further training for instructors is required. If pupils are engaged and productive while using Quizlet, teachers may think about using more individualized learning tactics. Vocabulary tasks on Quizlet may be modified for each pupil based on his or her learning pace and current knowledge. This research has the potential to shed light on the ways in which Quizlet influences the engagement and enthusiasm of ESL pupils. A favorable impression might mean that pupils find using Quizlet enjoyable and are thus motivated to actively engage in the process of improving their vocabulary via the use of the program. More research on the effectiveness of various digital technologies in the instruction of English to non-native speakers might be stimulated by the findings of this study. Researchers should dig more into the specific features of Quizlet that aid in the development of pupils' language skills and interest.

Conclusion

This study primarily focused on the pupils' perceptions in utilising an online application, as well as the benefits of technology-based learning for improving English vocabulary for primary school pupils. The outcomes of this study show that students had a favourable perception of using Quizlet to boost their vocabulary learning. In order to engage students and enhance their knowledge and skills, technology-based learning is essential. Improving vocabulary using Quizlet is an excellent method to increase pupils' vocabulary abilities since it results in incredibly favorable attitudes from pupils. Online learning such as Quizlet will also be used to boost students' confidence in utilising the English language. As a result, it is hoped that this

Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

study will motivate educators to employ an online-based method when teaching English vocabulary and inspire researchers to further investigate the efficacy of online-based learning.

References

- Al-Malki, A. (2020). Quizlet: An Online Application to Enhance EFL Foundation Students' Vocabulary Acquisition at Rustaq College of Education, Oman. Arab World English Journal, 6(6), 332–343. DOI: 10.24093/awej/call6.22
- Avisteva, R. T., & Halimi, S. S. (2021). The Use of Quizlet as a Vocabulary Acquisition Learning Media for Eleventh Grade Students. International University Symposium on Humanities and Arts 2020 (INUSHARTS 2020), 593(Inusharts 2020), 254–261.
- Barr, B. (2016). Checking the effectiveness of Quizlet® as a tool for vocabulary learning (Doctoral dissertation).
- Binh Minh, L. N. (2018). The effects of Quizlet on students' vocabulary acquisition in ESP classrooms: An experimental research at Hanoi Law University. In 9th International Conference on TESOL SEAMEO RETRAC'de sunulan poster. Vietnam: Ho Chi Minh City.
- Brittingham, E. E., & D'Amico, L. (2022). Using Multimedia Vocabulary Games to Improve Newcomer ESOL Students Motivation and Vocabulary Acquisition. ProQuest Dissertations and Theses, 85. Link
- Dizon, G. (2016). Quizlet in the EFL classroom: Enhancing academic vocabulary acquisition of Japanese university students. Teaching English with Technology, 16(2), 40–56.
- EFFECTIVE METHODS TO INCREASE VOCABULARY IN ENGLISH AS A. (n.d.). 735–745.
- Fithriani, R. (2021). The utilization of mobile-assisted gamification for vocabulary learning: Its efficacy and perceived benefits. Call-Ej, 22(3), 146–163.
- Köse, T., & Mede, E. (2016). Perceptions of efl learners about using an online tool for vocabulary learning in EFL classrooms: a pilot project in turkey. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 232, 362-372.
- Setiawan, R. M., & Wiedarti, P. (2020). The effectiveness of quizlet application towards students' motivation in learning vocabulary. *Studies in English Language and Education*, 7(1), 83–95. https://doi.org/10.24815/siele.v7i1.15359
- Sanosi, A. B. (2018). The effect of Quizlet on vocabulary acquisition. *Asian Journal of Education and e-learning*, 6(4).
- Skattenborg, V. N. (2020). MASTEROPPGAVE Using Quizlet for Vocabulary Learning. November.
- Singh, J., Steele, K., & Singh, L. (2021). Combining the Best of Online and Face-to-Face Learning: Hybrid and Blended Learning Approach for COVID-19, Post Vaccine, & Post-Pandemic World. In *Journal of Educational Technology Systems* (Vol. 50, Issue 2). https://doi.org/10.1177/00472395211047865
- Toy, F., & Buyukkarci, K. (2020). EFL Teachers' Perceptions about the effect of quizlet on vocabulary teaching. *i-Manager's Journal on English Language Teaching*, 10(4), 55.
- Tran, T. Q., & Nguyen, V. L. T. (2023). Insights Into Vietnamese Bilingual Students' Quizlet-Based English Vocabulary Learning. Journal of Language Teaching and Research, 14(3), 682–688. DOI: 10.17507/jltr.1403.15
- Waluyo, B., & Bucol, J. L. (2021). The impact of gamified vocabulary learning using quizlet on low-proficiency students. *Call-Ej*, 22(1), 158–179.
- Working, T., & Series, P. (n.d.). Using Quizlet for Academic Vocabulary Acquisition Brigham Young University of Hawai'i. 2019, 34–52.

Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

Xiao, Y., & Watson, M. (2019). Guidance on conducting a systematic literature review. Journal of Planning Education and Research, 39(1): 93-112. https://doi.org/10.1177/0739456X17723971