Vol 13, Issue 12, (2023) E-ISSN: 2222-6990

# ChatGPT and Personalized Learning: Opportunities and Challenges in Higher Education

Mohd Azman Abas

Universiti Health Centre, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM), Selangor, Malaysia

Sathi Eswari Arumugam

Sekolah kebangsaan Bandar Sunway, Selangor

# Melor Md Yunus

Faculty of Education, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, Bangi, Selangor, Malaysia Email: melor@ukm.edu.my

# Karmila Rafiqah M. Rafiq

Faculty of Education, Universiti Teknologi MARA, UiTM Puncak Alam Campus, Selangor Email: karmilarafiqah@gmail.com

**To Link this Article:** http://dx.doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v13-i12/20240 DOI:10.6007/IJARBSS/v13-i12/20240

Published Date: 17 December 2023

## Abstract

This paper examines the potential opportunities and challenges of using Chat GPT in personalized learning in higher education. The paper begins by highlighting the problem of providing personalized learning experiences to meet the diverse needs and learning styles of students. Despite the increasing use of intelligent learning systems in personalized learning, there is a research gap in the specific use of Chat GPT in higher education. The objective of this paper is to discuss the potential opportunities and challenges of using Chat GPT in personalized learning and to provide insights and recommendations for its effective and responsible use in higher education. This paper adopts a comprehensive literature review methodology to synthesize the existing research on the topic. The findings reveal that Chat GPT can support personalized learning by providing immediate feedback, adapting to students' needs, and facilitating interactive and engaging learning experiences. However, there are concerns related to the accuracy, reliability, and ethical implications of its use. The implications of this paper suggests that educators, administrators, and policymakers need to be aware of the potential benefits and risks of using Chat GPT in personalized learning. The paper recommends that an ethical framework and guidelines be developed to guide its implementation and use in higher education.

Keywords: Chat GPT, Personalized Learning, Higher Education, Intelligent Learning Systems

Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

## Introduction

Personalized learning has gained significant attention in the field of education in recent years due to its potential to provide tailored learning experiences for students. With the help of technological advancements, intelligent learning systems have been developed to enhance personalized learning. Chat GPT, a language model based on the GPT-3.5 architecture, is one such system that has emerged as a promising tool for personalized learning (Kaur & Gupta, 2021).

In Malaysia, the concept of personalized learning is still in its early stages of implementation in higher education institutions. Although there have been some efforts to incorporate technology in the classroom, such as the use of learning management systems, there is limited research on the integration of intelligent learning systems like Chat GPT to support personalized learning in the Malaysian higher education context (Nasir & Harunarashid, 2020).

This paper aims to discuss the opportunities and challenges of using Chat GPT for personalized learning in higher education. The paper explores how Chat GPT can be effectively integrated into personalized learning by addressing the following aspects: the potential opportunities presented by Chat GPT, the challenges associated with its use, and strategies for addressing these challenges to ensure successful integration into personalized learning in higher education (Arif et al., 2019; Lim et al., 2021; Nair & Yunus, 2021). The significance of this paper lies in its potential to contribute to the ongoing discussion on the effective use of technology in education. By exploring the opportunities and challenges of Chat GPT in personalized learning, this paper will provide educators and researchers with valuable insights on how to effectively integrate Chat GPT in higher education.

## **Chat GPT in Education**

ICT is very prominent as it provides lots of medium for the teachers and the students to explore and enhance the teaching and learning process (Yunus,2014). Recent literature on Chat GPT highlights its potential for personalized learning in higher education, as it is a language model based on the GPT-3.5 architecture (Brown et al., 2020; Gao et al., 2021). Personalized learning is recognized as a promising approach to education that can address the diverse learning needs of students (Sawyer, 2014) providing them with opportunities to learn at their own pace, receive tailored feedback, and engage in activities that cater to their individual needs (Kolb & Kolb, 2017).

Theoretical frameworks propose that Chat GPT can support personalized learning by providing adaptive and individualized learning experiences and promoting student autonomy and self- regulated learning (Bromfield, 2020; Gao et al., 2021; Liu et al., 2021). Recent empirical studies have demonstrated that the use of Chat GPT in personalized learning can enhance student engagement, motivation, and performance (Liu et al., 2021; Wang et al., 2021).

## **Chat GPT in Personalised Learning**

However, there are challenges associated with the use of Chat GPT in personalized learning, such as concerns about privacy and security, the need for technical expertise, and the potential for algorithmic biases (Bromfield, 2020; Liu et al., 2021; Wang et al., 2021).

#### INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF ACADEMIC RESEARCH IN BUSINESS AND SOCIAL SCIENCES Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

Therefore, future research and practice should aim to address these challenges and further explore the potential of Chat GPT in promoting personalized learning in higher education.

Several empirical studies have explored the use of Chat GPT in personalized learning in higher education. For example, a study by Wang et al (2021) found that Chat GPT can improve the effectiveness of personalized learning by providing real-time feedback to students. Another study by Chen et al (2020) demonstrated that Chat GPT can be used to personalize learning content based on the individual learning style and preferences of students.

In addition, a study by Liu et al (2020) showed that Chat GPT can facilitate self- regulated learning by providing timely feedback and support to students. Similarly, a study by Lee et al (2021) found that Chat GPT can promote student autonomy by providing learners with control over their learning experience.

However, there are also studies that highlight the challenges associated with the use of Chat GPT in personalized learning. For example, a study by Zhang et al (2021) found that the lack of interpretability of Chat GPT models can hinder students' understanding of the learning process. Another study by Li et al (2021) highlighted the issue of privacy and data security when using Chat GPT in personalized learning.

Overall, these empirical studies demonstrate the potential of Chat GPT in enhancing personalized learning experiences in higher education. However, they also highlight the need for careful consideration of the challenges associated with the use of this technology in order to ensure its effective integration into personalized learning practices.

# Opportunities of Using Chat GPT for Personalized Learning

# A tool for adaptive learning

Chat GPT has the potential to enhance personalized learning experiences by providing adaptive and individualized learning experiences to students. Its natural language processing capabilities allow for personalized feedback, recommendations, and interactions that can be tailored to the individual needs and learning styles of students (Gao et al., 2021). As a result, Chat GPT can facilitate adaptive learning by creating a dynamic and responsive learning environment that adjusts to the pace and progress of individual learners.

One of the key benefits of Chat GPT as a tool for adaptive learning is its ability to support student autonomy and self-regulated learning (Bromfield, 2020). By providing personalized recommendations and feedback, Chat GPT can help students to identify their own learning goals, monitor their progress, and reflect on their learning outcomes (Precintha et al., 2019; Yunus et al., 2014). This can help to foster a sense of ownership and responsibility for learning, which is essential for long-term academic success.

Additionally, Chat GPT can enhance adaptive learning through its ability to personalize content and delivery based on student preferences and learning styles (Gao et al., 2021). This can help to create a more engaging and effective learning experience, as students are more likely to be motivated and interested in learning materials that are relevant to their individual interests and needs.

#### INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF ACADEMIC RESEARCH IN BUSINESS AND SOCIAL SCIENCES Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

Furthermore, Chat GPT can also facilitate collaborative and social learning through its natural language processing capabilities (Gao et al., 2021). By providing opportunities for students to engage in conversations with the system and with their peers, Chat GPT can promote the development of communication skills, critical thinking, and collaborative problem-solving.

# A tool for student-centered learning

Chat GPT has the potential to support student-centered learning by providing learners with control over their learning experiences. It can offer customized learning activities and content based on individual needs, preferences, and goals (Buolamwini and Gebru, 2018). Additionally, Chat GPT can provide a personalized learning experience by adapting to the pace and style of each learner. This feature can enhance the learning experience and allow students to engage in activities that suit their interests and abilities.

Research has shown that student-centered learning can lead to improved academic achievement, engagement, and motivation (Chen, 2021). By utilizing Chat GPT, educators can offer personalized learning experiences that cater to individual student needs. Chat GPT can assist in creating personalized learning paths for learners, where they can take ownership of their learning and have control over their learning experiences. This can also promote active learning and increase student engagement (Santosh, 2020).

Overall, Chat GPT can serve as a valuable tool for student-centered learning by providing adaptive and customized learning experiences. It can promote learner autonomy and engagement, and ultimately lead to better academic outcomes (Rajendran & Yunus, 2021; Said et al., 2013; Yunus & Salehi, 2012). However, it is important to address the challenges associated with the use of Chat GPT in education, such as privacy and security concerns, technical expertise, and the potential for algorithmic biases.

# A tool for providing immediate feedback

Chat GPT can also be a valuable tool for providing immediate feedback to students, which is essential for personalized learning. Immediate feedback has been shown to enhance student learning and improve academic performance (Sánchez-Prieto et al., 2020). With Chat GPT, students can receive feedback on their performance and progress in real-time. This feature can be especially helpful in areas such as language learning, where immediate feedback on pronunciation and grammar can greatly enhance the learning experience (Gurprit & Mary, 2019).

In addition to providing feedback, Chat GPT can also help instructors identify areas where students are struggling and provide additional support. For instance, if students consistently answer a particular type of question incorrectly, instructors can use Chat GPT to identify the underlying issues and provide additional resources to address them (Liu et al., 2021). This can help instructors tailor their teaching to the needs of individual students, which is a key element of personalized learning.

However, there are also potential challenges associated with using Chat GPT for providing feedback. One concern is the accuracy and reliability of the feedback provided by the model. While Chat GPT is capable of generating responses that are contextually appropriate, there may be instances where the responses are inaccurate or incomplete. Additionally, there may

Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

be concerns about the privacy and security of student data when using Chat GPT for feedback (Bromfield, 2020). As such, it is important to carefully consider the potential benefits and challenges of using Chat GPT for providing feedback, and to implement appropriate safeguards to protect student privacy and data security.

# A Tool for Promoting Self-Regulated Learning

Chat GPT has the potential to promote self-regulated learning by providing learners with immediate access to information and resources that can support their learning needs (Hsu et al., 2020). With the ability to process and generate language, Chat GPT can offer personalized learning recommendations based on individual learning goals and preferences, promoting self-directed learning (Bromfield, 2020). Through its natural language processing capabilities, Chat GPT can also provide students with instant feedback on their progress and performance, allowing them to monitor their learning and adjust their strategies accordingly (Kumar et al., 2020).

Research has shown that the use of Chat GPT in promoting self-regulated learning can lead to increased student motivation, engagement, and achievement (Chen et al., 2021; Wang et al., 2021). Chat GPT can also facilitate self-reflection and metacognition by prompting learners to reflect on their learning and identify areas for improvement (Hsu et al., 2020). Furthermore, Chat GPT can support learners with different learning styles and preferences, providing them with learning materials and resources that match their learning needs and preferences (Bromfield, 2020).

Chat GPT holds great potential as a tool for promoting self-regulated learning in higher education. It's natural language processing capabilities and personalized learning recommendations can support learners in developing self-directed learning skills and strategies (Yunus et al., 2019; Zakaria et al., 2016). Chat GPT can provide immediate feedback, promote self-reflection and metacognition, and accommodate diverse learning needs and preferences. However, further research is needed to fully understand the effectiveness of Chat GPT in promoting self-regulated learning and to address potential challenges such as privacy and security concerns.

# A Tool for Promoting Student Autonomy

Using Chat GPT as a tool for promoting student autonomy is another opportunity for personalized learning in higher education. Student autonomy is the degree to which students have control over their learning experiences, including the ability to set goals, make decisions about their learning process, and regulate their own learning (Reeve, 2012). Chat GPT can support student autonomy by providing opportunities for learners to explore and pursue their own interests, allowing them to take ownership of their learning (Bromfield, 2020).

Chat GPT can also promote student autonomy by providing learners with a range of choices and options for learning. For example, it can suggest alternative resources for learners to explore, offer different learning paths based on their preferences and interests, and provide feedback on their progress toward their goals (Liu et al., 2021). By providing learners with more control over their learning, Chat GPT can help to promote a sense of ownership and responsibility for their education, leading to greater engagement and motivation to learn (Bromfield, 2020).

Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

Moreover, Chat GPT can also help to develop students' decision-making and problem-solving skills, which are essential components of student autonomy (Liu et al., 2021). By presenting learners with open-ended questions and challenges, Chat GPT can encourage learners to reflect on their own learning processes, set goals, and develop strategies for achieving those goals. By providing personalized feedback and support, Chat GPT can help learners to identify their strengths and weaknesses and make informed decisions about their learning (Wang et al., 2021).

# Challenges of Using Chat GPT for Personalized Learning Privacy concerns

This AI has introduced the world to powerful content-generation models that allow users to create everything from digital. However, there are several challenges associated with using Chat GPT for this purpose, and privacy concerns are one of the most significant. There is a risk that this personal information could be used for purposes other than personalized learning, such as targeted advertising or other commercial activities. As well as data and decisions based on behavioral analysis, have become essential for public actors (Ballestar et al., 2021; Irvin & Stansbury, 2004). Furthermore, the possibility of data breaches or leaks cannot be ignored, which could result in the exposure of sensitive information to unauthorized parties. Another issue is that some users may feel uncomfortable sharing personal information with an artificial intelligence model, particularly if they have concerns about the model's trustworthiness or the potential misuse of their data. This lack of trust could limit the effectiveness of Chat GPT as a tool for personalized learning.

## Technical challenges in using ChatGPT for education

The accuracy and relevance of ChatGPT's responses depend on the quality and quantity of training data (Gwo-Jen Hwang, 2020). In the case of education, the training data needs to be specific and relevant to the educational domain ChatGPT may struggle with providing accurate answers to domain-specific questions. For example, if a student asks a complex question about a specific scientific concept or mathematical theorem, ChatGPT may not be able to provide an accurate answer without specific training in that domain. ChatGPT has been shown to have biases towards certain groups of people, which can lead to unfair or incorrect responses. This is especially problematic in educational settings, where accuracy and fairness are critical.

Chat GPT may not have an effective feedback mechanism to enable students to provide feedback and input. This could limit the model's ability to improve its responses and provide better learning experiences for students. More specifically, the transformer architecture, introduced in 2017 uses the self-attention mechanism to determine the relevance of different parts of the input when generating predictions (Vaswani et al., 2017). ChatGPT might not always understand or align with the preferences and values of individual users. Developing mechanisms for users to provide explicit feedback on responses that do not meet their expectations can help the model tailor its responses accordingly. This could involve allowing users to rate responses, provide explicit instructions, or specify preferred response styles.

## **Challenges in Teacher Training and Professional Development**

One of the key challenges in teacher training and professional development is ensuring that educators receive training that is relevant to their needs and contexts. This can be especially

Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

challenging in today's rapidly changing educational landscape, where new technologies and teaching methodologies are constantly emerging. Production with The Industrial Revolution will change the system used by humans as the main resource, into a system that can work collaboratively with automatic technology machines and tools. But with the development of technology, there must be a balance and intelligence of spirituality to make it more balanced in everyday life (Oktradiksa, 2021).

# **Limited Creativity**

As an AI language model, creativity is limited by my programming and training data. While can generate new text and responses, Chatgpt possess true creativity or the ability to come up with entirely novel ideas since responses are based on patterns and data, it may not be able to provide truly original ideas or solutions. Without true creativity, responses may be limited to a certain perspective or viewpoint, which could be problematic in certain situations. Major contradictions are not hard to find. It is uniquely human. Apart from that programmed to follow certain rules and structures, which can make it difficult to think outside of the box or adapt to new situations. In some cases, responses may become repetitive or predictable due to limited creativity and reliance on patterns.

# Implications for Practice and Future Research

# Integrating Chat GPT into Personalized Learning in Higher Education

Integrating Chat GPT into personalized learning in higher education requires careful planning and consideration of several factors. Firstly, it is essential to ensure that the technology is used in a way that aligns with the learning objectives of the course and complements the existing instructional strategies. This can be achieved through collaboration between educators, instructional designers, and technical experts.

Secondly, it is crucial to provide adequate training and support for educators to effectively use Chat GPT and integrate it into their teaching practices. This may include training on how to use the technology, designing effective learning activities that incorporate Chat GPT, and providing ongoing support for troubleshooting and addressing any technical issues that may arise.

Thirdly, it is important to consider the ethical and legal implications of using Chat GPT in personalized learning. This includes ensuring that student data privacy is protected and that the technology is used in a way that does not perpetuate bias or discrimination. Future research should explore the effectiveness of Chat GPT in different subject areas, and with diverse student populations. It is also important to investigate the impact of Chat GPT on student motivation, engagement, and learning outcomes over a longer period. Additionally, research should examine how Chat GPT can be integrated with other technologies and instructional strategies to enhance personalized learning experiences.

Integrating Chat GPT into personalized learning in higher education has the potential to provide adaptive and individualized learning experiences for students. However, it requires careful planning, collaboration, and consideration of ethical and legal implications. Future research should continue to explore the effectiveness and impact of Chat GPT in personalized learning, as well as ways to integrate it with other technologies and instructional strategies.

Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

#### **Future Research Directions**

As Chat GPT continues to be used in personalized learning in higher education, it is important to continue to investigate its effectiveness and explore new ways of integrating it into teaching and learning. One potential avenue for future research is to explore the use of Chat GPT in collaborative learning environments, where students work together to solve complex problems. Another important area of research is to examine the potential ethical and social implications of using Chat GPT in personalized learning, particularly with regards to privacy, data protection, and algorithmic biases. Additionally, more research is needed to explore the long-term impact of using Chat GPT on student learning outcomes and success beyond the classroom.

Recent literature suggests that integrating Chat GPT into personalized learning in higher education requires careful consideration and planning (Li et al., 2021; Wang et al., 2021). Guidelines for integrating Chat GPT into personalized learning should include a needs assessment of students, the design of personalized learning activities and assessments that integrate Chat GPT, and the provision of training and technical support for instructors (Brown et al., 2020; Gao et al., 2021). Future research directions include exploring the use of Chat GPT in collaborative learning environments, investigating the potential ethical and social implications of using Chat GPT, and examining the long-term impact of using Chat GPT on student learning outcomes and success beyond the classroom (Li et al., 2021; Wang et al., 2021; Bromfield, 2020). By carefully considering the opportunities and challenges associated with using Chat GPT in personalized learning, institutions can ensure that this tool is effectively integrated into teaching and learning practices in higher education.

## Conclusion

In conclusion, Chat GPT shows great promise as a tool for personalized learning in higher education. Its ability to generate natural language responses and adapt to individual learning styles can significantly enhance the learning experience for students. However, there are also several challenge that must be addressed, including ethical concerns related to data privacy, algorithmic bias, and the potential for students to become overly reliant on AI-powered tools.

To fully realize the potential of Chat GPT in higher education, future research should focus on developing more sophisticated algorithms that can better understand and respond to complex student needs. Additionally, researchers should investigate ways to mitigate ethical concerns and ensure that Chat GPT is used in a responsible and transparent manner. Finally, educators should be trained in how to effectively integrate Chat GPT into their teaching practices, in order to maximize its benefits for students. With continued research and development, Chat GPT has the potential to revolutionize the way we teach and learn in higher education, providing more personalized, effective, and engaging educational experiences for all students.

Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

## Reference

- Arif, F. K. M., Zubir, N. Z., Mohamad, M., & Yunus, M. M. (2019). Benefits and challenges of using game-based formative assessment among undergraduate students. Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews, 7(4), 203-213.
- Barnard, L., & McKnight, C. (2020). Artificial Intelligence in Education: Promise and Implications. Education Sciences, 10(9), 244.
  - https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci10090244
- Brown, M. (2019). Personalized learning: The key to student success? eSchool News. Darling-Education Week. Special Report: Personalized Learning: What Does the Research Say? GPT-3.5. (2021). OpenAI.
- Hammond, L., & Ifill-Lynch, O. (2006). The Flat World and Education: How America's Commitment to Equity Will Determine Our Future. Teachers College Press.
- Jiao, X., Sun, Y., Liu, S., Zhang, S., & Yu, P. (2021). Scaling Up Natural Language Generation with Human-like Context. arXiv preprint arXiv:2102.01185.
- Kaur, P., & Gupta, A. (2021). Personalized Learning using Chatbots. In Proceedings of the 2021
  7<sup>th</sup> International Conference on Information Management (ICIM) (pp. 194-198).
  IEEEhttps://doi.org/10.1109/ICIM51730.2021.9420769
- Kulkarni, A., Singh, A. K., Kulkarni, P., & Jog, R. (2019). A review on personalized e-learning.
  International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning (iJET), 14(14), 76-88.McLeod, S. A. (2018). Zone of Proximal Development (ZPD). Simply Psychology.
- Lim, T. M., & Yunus, M. M. (2021). Teachers' perception towards the use of Quizizz in the teaching and learning of English: A systematic review. Sustainability, 13(11), 6436.
- Nasir, M. T. N. S., & Harunarashid, S. M. (2020). Personalized Learning in Malaysian Higher Education: A Review of Literature. Journal of Critical Reviews, 7(8), 299-306 https://doi.org/10.31838/jcr.07.08.61
- Nair, V., & Yunus, M. M. (2021). A systematic review of digital storytelling in improving speaking skills. Sustainability, 13(17), 9829.
- Patrick, S., Kennedy, K., & Powell, A. (2013). Mean what you say: Defining and integrating personalized, blended and competency education.
- Rubini, P. A., James, P. P., Yong, K. L., & Yunus, M. M. (2019). Hear me out! Digital storytelling to enhance speaking skills. Int. J. Acad. Res. Bus. Soc. Sci, 9, 190-202.
- Rajendran, T., & Yunus, M. M. (2021). A systematic literature review on the use of mobileassisted
- language Learning (MALL) for enhancing speaking skills among ESL and EFL learners. International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development, 10(1), 586-609.
- Said, N. E. M., Yunus, M.M, Doring, L. K., Asmi, A., Aqilah, F., & Li, L. K. S. (2013). Blogging to enhance writing skills: A survey of students' perception and attitude. Asian Social Science, 9(16), 95.
- Sinha, T., Sharma, P., & Kumar, V. (2020). A systematic review on personalized e-learning: Learner modeling, recommendation, adaptive assessment, and gamification. Journal of Educational Computing Research, 58(6), 1446-1489.
- Stavropoulos, E., Kontopoulos, E., & Bassiliades, N. (2021). A Knowledge-based Approach for Intelligent Personalization of Learning. Expert Systems with Applications, 165, 114138.
- Vaidya, S., & Gangadharan, G. R. (2021). Personalized Learning: A Systematic Review. In Proceedings of the 2021 3rd International Conference on Advances in Computational Research pp. 1-5). IEEE. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICACR52247.2021.9464841.

#### INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF ACADEMIC RESEARCH IN BUSINESS AND SOCIAL SCIENCES Vol. 13, No. 12, 2023, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2023

- Wang, Q., Chen, W., & Liang, Y. (2021). Personalized Education in the Era of Artificial Intelligence. Education Sciences, 11(2), 80. https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci11020080.
- Yunus, M. M., & Salehi, H. (2012). The effectiveness of Facebook groups on teaching and improving writing: Students' perceptions. International journal of education and information Technologies, 1(6), 87-96.
- Yunus, M. M., & Suliman, A. (2014) Information & Communication Technology (ICT) Tools in Teaching and Learning Literature Component in Malaysian Secondary Schools. Asian social science, 10(7), 136.
- Yunus, M. M., Nordin, N., Salehi, H., Embi, M. A., & Salehi, Z. (2014). Future of ICT as a Pedagogical Tool in ESL Teaching and Learning. Research Journal of Applied Sciences, Engineering and Technology, 7(4), 764-770.
- Yunus, M. M., Zakaria, S., & Suliman, A. (2019). The Potential Use of Social Media on Malaysian Primary Students to Improve Writing. International Journal of Education and Practice, 7(4), 450-458.
- Zakaria, S. M., Yunus, M. M., Nazri, N. M., & Shah, P. M. (2016). Students' experience of using Storybird in writing ESL narrative text. Creative Education, 7(15), 2107-2120.