

Planning and Implementation Practices of Preschool Teachers in Teaching and Learning Moral Education in National-Type Primary Schools

Nurhana Sabri, Suziyani Mohamed

Faculty of Education, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, 43600, Selangor, Malaysia, Faculty of
Early Childhood Education, IPGMK Perempuan Melayu, Malaysia

Corresponding Author Email: @suziyani@ukm.edu.my

To Link this Article: <http://dx.doi.org/10.6007/IJARPED/v13-i3/22059>

DOI:10.6007/IJARPED/v13-i3/22059

Published Online: 04 July 2024

Abstract

Teachers play an important role in shaping high moral behavior among students through the practices of planning and implementation of teaching. The use of teaching methods and strategies as well as teaching aids, and the writing of teaching objectives are the teacher's preparation in planning for teaching and learning. Preparation in planning and implementation can increase the effectiveness of their teaching. A case study was conducted with the aim of exploring planning and implementation practices for teaching and learning Moral Education among preschool teachers in Malaysia. The data were obtained from interview and observation on four research participants as well as document analysis, and were analysed descriptively with the assistance of NVIVO 12. Results of this study identified five themes namely teaching methods, teaching strategies, teaching aids usage and teaching objectives writing and the obstacles in planning and implementation. It was discovered that preschool teachers implemented teaching according to the curriculum guidelines and were able to adapt according to their own understanding, write objectives clearly, and select teaching aids suitable for students. However, they have poor selection of teaching methods and strategies suitable for students due to lack of training regarding Moral Education, lack of teaching aids for preschool, and low level of student understanding. This study is beneficial as a guideline for preschool teachers for teaching to be more effective for students. Student behavior can be developed through effective planning and implementation practices by teachers in classrooms.

Keywords: Planning Practice, Implementation Practice, Preschool Teacher, Moral Education, Case Study

Introduction

The development of high moral behavior can initiate from the early stages of schooling (Rukiyati et al., 2020). A teacher bears an imperative responsibility in developing good behavior among preschoolers. Among the important tasks of teachers is to harness existing knowledge in performing effective teaching and learning processes in Moral Education in

preschool classrooms. The effective teaching and learning process includes the practice of planning and implementation, and teaching evaluation. The teaching and learning process of Moral Education is applied among preschoolers according to the education system in several foreign countries. The process is performed according to planning, implementation and evaluation practices. The aim of the subject is to develop positive values in oneself by cultivating five main values and attitudes, which are perseverance, respect for others, responsibility, national identity, and high commitment (Hong Kong Education Center, 2022). In contrast to Japan, the teaching and learning of Moral Education has been practiced throughout the implementation of educational activities or directly in daily life. Its implementation is deemed as an initiative to create individuals with a healthy body and mind, truth and justice, respect for other individuals, respect for work, and be responsible and enthusiastic in preserving independence as well as create a peaceful nation and society (Budi, 2020). In Malaysia, the teaching and learning process of Moral Education is applied in the education system through subjects from preschool to secondary school level. In preschool level, teachers are assigned to teach non-Muslim preschoolers using The National Standard Preschool Curriculum (NSPC). It is mandatory to implement teaching and learning of Moral Education in preschool when there are five or more non-Muslim preschooler in a classroom (Ministry of Education, 2017). The subject was created as a medium to mould noble people with various religious beliefs and to develop high moral behavior among preschoolers. The curriculum includes 14 moral values as guidance to teach the preschoolers.

The initial stage of teaching and learning process involves the planning process of Moral Education teaching, which includes the selection of teaching methods and strategies. Suppiah et al (2017) claimed that the traditional method of using pens and blackboards is still implemented by teachers, and is more teacher-centered. This situation creates an unconvincing environment for preschoolers to learn moral values. In addition, unexciting teaching aids are also used by teachers in teaching Moral Education, as reported by (Vasanthan, 2019). Teachers are more likely to employ existing teaching aids due to limited time to produce intriguing materials that can attract students' attention. The teachers' creativity is also less prominent in using existing materials during question-and-answer activities to stimulate students' mind regarding the ongoing teaching and learning process in the classroom (Sylvester, 2021). On the contrary, student-centered activities are more suitable for Moral Education considering that teaching of values through singing, habits, questioning and storytelling methods are able to change behavior for the better (Rukiyati et al., 2020). The selection of attractive teaching aids in learning activities can positively impact students as they are given the opportunity to interact with the material and comfortably develop their understanding of the values learned without difficulties (Balakrishnan & Thambu, 2017; Shafinaz & Faridah, 2018).

From the aspect of objective writing, some teachers are unskilled in writing teaching objectives and reflection explicitly, according to (Andi, 2019). Objective writing is considered incomplete and unmeasurable, which causes the implementation of teaching and learning to be irregular and not meeting the learning needs of students as student achievement and teaching cannot be measured accurately. These shortcomings lead to ineffective and unattractive teaching. Therefore, the purpose of this study was to answer the research question of what is the planning practice of teacher in teaching and learning of Moral Education. This study only focuses on planning and implementation practices. It is expected that the planning and implementation of teaching by teachers for Moral Education can assist preschoolers to understand moral values and practice in their daily lives.

Literature Review**Strategies and Teaching Methods in Teaching and Learning**

The planning and implementation practice of teaching is performed by teachers to help them deliver quality teaching. Several aspects can favour effective teaching and learning, including the selection of appropriate teaching methods which potentially increases students' interest in learning. Mok (2011) explained that method is a means of achieving teaching objectives through implementation in a short time. In Moral Education, one of the best teaching methods in planning lessons is through storytelling.

In a study by Balakrishnan and Thambu (2017), this method had an effect on six study participants consisting of preschool students. All of them enjoyed the storytelling method in the Moral Education. During the implementation period of the study, the participants were enlivened by the arrival of the researcher to their classroom to listen to interesting moral stories. The storytelling method became more exciting when using various intonations for voice changes for different characters, whether good or bad characters. Most of them were passionate about imitating the character's voice based on their own version. This statement is supported by Maila et al (2020) explaining that the storytelling method is an effective medium in discussing the moral dilemma faced. It also assists in solving the problem of immoral behavior based on the consequences at the end of the story.

Subsequently, the teaching method through discussion has an impact on the learning of Moral Education. In this method, preschoolers become friendly with each other, and the relationship between students and teachers will become more active and positive which increases students' motivation and understanding about certain topics (Syahirah & Aderi, 2022). Several previous studies have supported the implementation of discussion method on teacher's teaching and learning practices (Pratama et al., 2015; Abiddin & Ismail, 2016). These studies explained that the discussion method was the main method preferred by the study participants to promote active learning of preschoolers in classrooms. Haris and Kassim (2016) stated the need for the teacher to be a guide in the discussion method to explain the discussion format, prevent students from gibbering, and emphasize students' talents. Thus, selecting the appropriate method in planning lessons can create a fun learning atmosphere in an effective Moral Education teaching and learning.

Furthermore, in planning and implementation of teaching, the selection of effective teaching strategies affects the teaching and learning process in the classroom. Mok (2011) defined strategy as an organized plan of action or operation. Based on the teacher's guide book of NSPC (2017), nine teaching strategies are suggested: (i) learning through play strategy, (ii) themed approach strategy, (iii) integrated approach strategy, (iv) project-based learning strategy, (v) inquiry-based learning strategy, (vi) student-centered learning, (vii) contextual learning, (viii) mastery learning, and (viiii) learning strategy based on multiple intelligences. The selection of appropriate strategy in planning lessons can improve student understanding. In addition, Shahida (2021) explained the importance of teaching strategies to produce outstanding generations in the future, and to develop cognitive levels and self-potential according to diversity of skills desired under the guidance of teachers. Mardziah et al (2021) asserted that most government preschool teachers prefer to use a teacher-centered strategy to control the class, and the teaching process becomes easier and more guided, and ensures student discipline is controlled throughout the teaching and learning process. In contrast, Aliza and Zamri (2017) perceived that teachers are more likely to implement student-centered strategy due to the age factor of preschoolers. At this stage, students have a high level of curiosity and exploration of the surrounding situation. Therefore, it is recommended for

teachers to conduct activities involving student-centered strategy, such as role-playing and simulation activities in the teaching of Moral Education.

Role Model

In addition, the role model method is also highlighted. This method can create a friendly and suitable environment in fostering the physical, emotional, social and moral development of preschool students. A friendly relationship between teachers and students in teaching and learning is an important support system in learning moral values. For example, preschoolers will always be reminded to apologize when they make mistakes, put toys back in their place after activities, and learn to respect others as well as accept the good moral behavior of others (Maila et al., 2012).

Teaching Aids

Furthermore, the selection of teaching aids is one of the guides for teachers to plan effective teaching. Teaching aids are learning tools that are used according to the needs and suitability of teaching and learning sessions, including materials or tools to help vision, hearing, touch and reading (Faez et al., 2022; Syafiqah & Nazirah, 2018). Examples of teaching aids are whiteboards, textbooks, exercise books and pens as well as technology-based materials, such as YouTube videos, live worksheets and learning software. According to Rabaah et al. (2021), the use of teaching aids in teaching is beneficial to preschoolers, which can help students in stimulating their focus to learn. For example, the use of interesting moral story books in teaching moral values can create a sense of excitement among them, especially large-sized story books with a small number of pages, and contain colorful illustrations and interesting cartoons (Balakrishnan and Thambu, 2017).

Indirectly, teaching with interesting teaching aids can have a positive effect on academic excellence. Connie (2021) also supported the use of teaching aids in preschool teaching, particularly for early mathematics learning. It provides an advantage to the planning and implementation practice of early mathematics teaching and learning, especially the introduction of mathematical concepts. However, Faez et al (2022) expressed different opinions regarding the use of teaching aids. There are three main obstacles for teachers in using teaching aids that are unattractive to students, namely time constraints, insufficient material preparation, and other task commitments. Teachers have limited time to prepare compelling teaching materials due to their increasing workload. In addition, the existing materials are not sufficient to produce compelling teaching aids due to the cost constraint to purchase necessary materials. Eventually, teachers are more focused on using existing materials in the classroom as simple and easy teaching aids, such as worksheets and YouTube videos.

Teaching Objectives

Furthermore, writing teaching objectives is emphasized, which aims to ensure that teaching activities run smoothly until the end of the teaching hours. It is also to ensure that the implementation of activities is focused on the skills to be conveyed. Objective writing is defined as a clear statement of what preschoolers will learn through the teacher's teaching (Woolfolk, 1998). It is the first step and must be performed by teachers in planning lessons (Akhiar & Shamsina, 2016). In planning and implementation of teaching, teachers need to write teaching objectives that match the preschoolers' level of understanding as well as refer

to the curriculum as writing objectives will be a guide for the implementation of all activities in the classroom.

In addition, Mastura et al (2021) also agreed on the need to write teaching objectives accurately according to the preschoolers' level of understanding. The study asserted that objective writing helps the teacher to identify the level of preschooler achievement for the skills learned, and then helps in reviewing lessons to master the skills. Thus, teachers need to be competent in writing objectives based on the stipulations of the syllabus, number of students, and time allocation in the timetable.

Furthermore, Johdi (2007) explained that objective writing that matches the level of student understanding is one of the characteristics of an effective teacher. This characteristic will also explain the objectives before the teaching and learning session begins in preparation for learning new topics and change students' thinking about the knowledge, skills and behaviors that need to be achieved when the session ends. Meanwhile, Saemah and Zamri (2017) emphasized the effect of writing inaccurate objectives. One of the main effects is that teachers are unable to create an interesting learning atmosphere as students could not understand the content of the lesson. This results in various questions arising regarding the skills taught by teachers. Overall, every aspect of teaching planning and implementation by teachers, including teaching methods and strategies, use of teaching aids, and objective writing was examined to see the extent of preschool teachers' practices in ensuring that the teaching and learning process took place well and in an orderly manner.

Methodology

Study Design

This study was conducted using a qualitative approach in the form of a case study in four different locations in Malacca: two Chinese National-Type Schools, and two Tamil National-Type Schools. Case study was selected based on the appropriateness of the design in exploring the teaching planning practices of preschool teachers in the teaching and learning of Moral Education. According to Yin (2018); Noraini (2010), case study can help researchers obtain in-depth and meaningful information about a practice as well as create a pattern of similarity in each place in relation to research in the real world.

Participants

A total of four participants were selected based on the purposive sampling technique, who met these criteria, such as teachers in government preschools, have more than 10 years of teaching experience, and have the education level at least diploma, degree or master's degree in the field of early childhood education. The participants in this study were teachers of National-Type School in Malacca, where Moral Education is taught. Ghazali and Sufean (2018) explained that the purposive sampling technique is very suitable for selecting participants in the case study as the participants have various information needed by the researcher regarding the development and progress of the study location.

In addition, this study also considered the suggestion from an official in the District Education Office to involve female teachers as participants. To protect the identity of participants, self-identification was given to each of them using preschool teacher (GP) codes, such as GP1, GP2, GP3 and GP4. Chinese preschool teachers were coded as GP1 and GP2, while GP3 and GP4 were Tamil preschool teachers. The profile of the participants is summarized in Table 1.

Table 1

Profile of research participants

Participant	Age	Field	Education level	Service period
GP1	40 years old	Diploma in Early Childhood Education (Chinese) Bachelor's Degree in Chinese	Bachelor's Degree	17 years
GP2	39 years old	Diploma in Teaching for Early Childhood Education Master's Degree in Administration	Master's Degree	11 years
GP3	43 years old	Diploma in Teaching for Early Childhood Education Bachelor's Degree in Early Childhood Education	Bachelor's Degree	17 years
GP4	40 years old	Diploma in Tamil Language and Mathematics Education Master's Degree in Early Childhood Education	Master's Degree	14 years

Data Collection Methods and Instruments

This study used semi-structured interviews, observation and document analysis for data collection to answer the research questions. Semi-structured interviews were used to find out the participants' in-depth views on the scope of the study (Merriam, 2016). This method is also favourable to researchers as the number of questions can be added to obtain additional information from unclear explanations. Observation is generally conducted to collect data directly during teaching and learning sessions for all activities, events or situations that are needed, felt, heard and observed when the research participants are unable to explain about something in the interview (Ghazali & Sufean, 2018).

Document analysis method supports other findings by confirming the information obtained, and it is highly useful for researchers in understanding the situation quickly (Merriam, 2016; Ghazali & Sufean, 2018). This method can provide immediate information to researchers since the data transcription process is not necessitate to analyze documents such as daily lesson plans and teaching resource images.

For all three methods, interview and observation protocols as well as document analysis record were prepared. In the interview protocol, it contained four types of questions, namely opening questions, transition questions, questions according to the research questions, and closing questions, including 15 question items. Among the contents of the protocol were four planning and implementation practices, involving teaching methods and strategies, writing teaching objectives and teaching aids selection. In the interview session, participants were allowed to express their views based on the questions without restriction. For observation protocol, it consisted of a checklist of information on the implementation of Moral Education teaching and learning, and field observation notes.

The checklist encompassed items of planning and implementation practices in teaching, namely the teaching strategies, teaching aids and teaching objectives writing. The results of observation were recorded narratively in a form. The form consisted of an initial phase entry section (induction set phase), development phase and closing phase. In the document analysis, brief notes were provided for each document.

Data Analysis

The research data were analysed descriptively using the thematic analysis method as recommended by (Braun and Clarke, 2006). Data obtained from interviews, observations and document analysis were transcribed, retyped and systematically managed using a folder system, and labeled according to specific codes. The coding process was performed using NVIVO 12 software. Codes were constructed based on appropriate terms to represent a word or sentence from interview transcripts, observation notes and document analysis notes. Furthermore, the researcher constructed a theme in accordance with the findings of this study, and revised the theme until it completely supported and answered the research questions. Finally, report was written descriptively, concisely, logically and without repetition.

Validity and Reliability

The results of this study were subjected to validity and reliability processes based on participant review, audit trail, peer review and triangulation techniques. The participant review technique was proposed by Ghazali and Sufean (2018) to obtain the validity of the interview protocol, where the interview transcripts were reviewed by the research participants. As consent to the interview transcript, the participants signed the consent form. Any changes were made accordingly during a review period of one to two weeks. Subsequently, the views and ideas of an expert in the Moral Education field were obtained based on peer review techniques.

The expert reviewed the interview protocol appropriately, and provided comments on the construction of themes by the researcher based on the findings of this study. The triangulation technique used in this study involved the triangulation of three recommended methods for conducting case study, namely interview, observation and document analysis, to obtain data saturation (Yin, 2018). For the reliability of this study, the audit trail technique was applied. The researcher documented all the reflection processes and recorded all the activities conducted throughout this study using a research notebook.

Research Findings

In this study, five themes were identified that focused on preschool teachers' planning and implementation practices in the teaching and learning of Moral Education: (a) teaching methods, (b) teaching strategies, (c) use of teaching aids, (d) writing teaching objectives, and (e) obstacles in planning and implementation.

Teaching Methods

Based on the findings from interviews and observations, six subthemes were identified in the theme of teaching methods as summarized in Table 2.

Table 2

Teaching methods used by research participants

No.	Method	GP1	GP2	GP3	GP4	Total
1	Storytelling Method	/	/	/	/	4
2	Problem Solving Methods	-	-	-	/	1
3	Discussion Method	/	/	/	/	4
4	Question and Answer Method	/	/	/	/	4
5	Simulation Method	/	/	/	/	4
6	Demonstration Method	/	/	-	-	2

Based on the findings, all participants were more likely to use four methods in teaching Moral Education, namely the storytelling method, discussion method, question-and-answer method and simulation method. In implementing the storytelling method, the stories delivered were linked to the actual situation of the students. The examples given in the stories were clear and simple for students to comprehend. This was supported by the interview statement from GP2 who used the storytelling method to explain the value of thrift as follows:

".. I will talk about the importance of saving energy. An example is electricity. We relate it to our homes..One by one tell us about the importance.." (GP2)

Analysis of observation in the class found that all participants used the discussion method and the question-and-answer method during teaching. The teacher conducted a discussion in the classroom in groups regarding the situation based on the video screening. During that period, the teacher also encouraged all the students to respond to the behavior that was seen in the video, either good or bad behavior. Then, the question-and-answer method was implemented to attract the interest of passive students and those who did not pay attention to the teacher's questions. The teacher called out the names of certain students and asked them questions. Teacher guidance in answering the questions was given. The following observation notes proved the implementation of these methods:

The teacher responded to the students' questions and repeated the tirukkural proverb several times. Thirukkural proverb related to the virtue of high thrift. Questions were presented to stimulate students to think about the act of showing high thrift. To introduce the proverb, the teacher also showed a video source in Tamil language. Students who did not read the tirukkural proverb were called out to read it in front of the class with the guidance of the teacher.

Moreover, the participant coded GP1 performed a demonstration method for the craft activity in the teaching of Moral Education. The craft activities were related to the value of love for animals. Teachers planned the craft activities in the development phase by making pencil cases from recycled materials. Students were asked to make their own pencil cases after the teacher demonstrated the steps to make them from toilet and kitchen tissue rolls based on the following observation notes:

The teacher has shown how to make pencil cases and decorate them using printed animal shapes. Students looked closely at how to make pencil cases in front of the class. Tissue rolls

were given by the teacher at the back of the classrooms. Students lined up politely to take the necessary items. Other materials were given and the students made their own pencil cases individually.

Furthermore, teaching activities took place using simulation methods. Based on the interview with GP1, the method used for the craft activity was explained. The teacher instructed the students to perform simulations, such as singing activities using the masks they made. This was supported by the following interview statements:

"...depends on the theme.. if it's an animal.. after making the craft, for example a mask.. we showed it in front of the class one by one, then we guide them to make it, and they acted or sang using the mask they made" (GP1)

Other participants also performed simulation activities as in the following interview statement.

"the students enjoyed playing for the simulation and I allowed everyone to get involved...There weren't many students...If there are two characters, we rotate and give others a chance.." (GP2)

"After that, they carried out simulation activities on thrift..after the activity, they usually colored pictures related to thrift." (GP3)

"if I do it in the form of a simulation... Ask them to act... they like it... sometimes, I ask them to do activities like helping their parents at home, make a video with their parents, and send it to me" (GP4)

In contrast, GP4 used problem solving method during teaching to stimulate students to think about teaching topics during the Moral Education slot. Typically, participants perform methods in the induction set phase to stimulate and prepare students for the subsequent teaching topic. The teacher gave certain situation and asked the students to solve the problem. Findings from the interview of GP4 proved the following statement.

"I related it to the student's actions to make it easier for them to understand... I recall... or someone said that you can't do that, after that I asked who the teacher was angry with that day? Try asking like that. So if the teacher was angry, how was the teacher angry? Why was the teacher angry? he didn't do the work. So, why didn't you do the work.. was the teacher angry? I said no, he was noisy. Students were given questions and answers to let them realize their own mistakes, after that I continued with the discussion..."(GP4)

In summary, the findings of this study indicated that all participants selected teaching methods that were appropriate to their planned activities. The implementation of teaching also followed the activity plan. Participants varied their teaching methods in the Moral Education slot by focusing on teaching values that were appropriate for students, and also following the weekly theme.

Teaching Strategies

The selection of teaching strategies in the implementation of the Moral Education slot was referred to the NSPC Curriculum as guideline. The participants took into account its suitability for the implementation of teaching and learning in their respective schools. The analysis of interviews and observations formulated two subthemes, namely the selection of teaching strategies and the duration of teaching. In this study, the participants chose five teaching strategies: (a) learning while playing, (b) project-based strategy, (c) student-centered strategy, (d) integrated approach strategy, and (e) themed approach strategy in teaching sessions. The purpose of choosing teaching strategies was to facilitate the teachers' teaching according to their understanding and appropriate to the students. All participants applied learning while playing and project-based strategy based on the following interview statements.

"...or learning while playing...I always apply learning while playing in moral education during free play time..at that time, the teacher only guides..So, if they behave badly, I will reprimand them.." (GP1)

"He prepared the flower plant with the help of his parents. Some were made with real tree trunks. I asked if he had cut the stem? He answered no, he took the existing one. He already pruned it so I linked it with integration..after that, I planted it for garden decoration project..the result of this student's work was the decoration of the garden project..so I used it as a tree label" (GP4)

The implementation of the strategy was also proven through the observation notes as follows:

The next step, the teacher introduced kitchen tissue rolls as a recycling material. In addition, the teacher explained that the tissue roll can be recycled into a pencil case. Existing pencil cases (giraffe, elephant, zebra) were shown in classroom. Then, the teacher showed how to make pencil cases and decorate them using animal shapes that the teacher had printed.

Furthermore, all participants agreed that student-centered strategy was one of the teachers' preferred strategies. Based on interviews and observations, it was identified that all participants applied this strategy in the Moral Education slot. Participants planned and implemented activities by engaging students actively. This was verified by all the participants as follows:

"I prefer a student-based approach...students do it themselves" (GP3)

"Moral Education students have to be simple to make it easier for them to understand. Apply the values. More student-centered activities are implemented so that they will better understand what is being delivered" (GP4)

Findings of the observation also supported the use of student-centered strategy from the observation GP1 and GP2 as follows:

Subsequently, the teacher continued the activity with the disposal of recyclable items into the bin. In this activity, the teacher gave the opportunity to all the students to put the recyclable

items into the correct bin. The teacher asked the students to clap their hands when the students did the right thing. Reward was also given.(GP1)

The teacher called out all the students to take and look at the water in the basin in front of the classroom, and then sat in their respective places.(GP2)

Based on the analysis of interviews and observations, the participants implemented an integrated approach strategy with an emphasis on several integrations in teaching, as shown in Table 3.

Table 3

Integrated approach strategy

No.	Integration	GP1	GP2	GP3	GP4	Total
1	Integration between pillars	/	/	/	/	4
2	Integration between subjects	-	-	-	/	1
3	Integration between values	/	/	/	/	4

All participants of GP1, GP2, GP3 and GP4 integrated the pillar of Moral Education with other pillars and values in the teaching slot. They applied integration to facilitate the planning and implementation of activities related to the topics taught. The integration method was performed according to the suitability of the students and the topic to be taught. Meanwhile, only GP4 integrated the subject of Tamil Education with Moral Education based on the following interview statement.

“Usually, I combine Moral Education with Tamil language. There are proverbs in Tamil, right? In the Tamil language, there are 'tirikural' and 'arthicuri' like holy verses. In Tamil, there are many tirikurals in the 1330 poems studied in year 1 and mainstream. I use the slot to combine Tamil with moral education” (GP4)

This was supported by observations made on GP4. During teaching, the participant introduced the proverb 'tirikural' in the development phase of the teaching slot. All students were required to follow and read the proverb based on the video shown by the teacher as follows:

The teacher gave an explanation based on the proverb 'tirukkural'. The banana picture card was used as a parable for the learned proverb. The teacher responded to the students' questions and repeated the tirukkural proverb multiple times. Thirukkural is related to the virtue of high thrift. To introduce the proverb, the teacher showed a video in Tamil language.

In addition, participants also implemented a themed approach strategy in the Moral Education slot. Among the relevant themes were the theme of animals, vegetables and plants. This was supported by GP1 and GP4 participants when interviewed.

“ Handcrafts took a lot of time because it was difficult and the activities I conducted followed the theme...such as animal theme, we can make pencil cases or animal masks..” (GP1)

“ ...in terms of activity planning, sometimes I follow the theme..for example, this week's theme was vegetables. I associated vegetables with environmental morality only.” (GP4)

For the duration of teaching as the second sub-theme, the participants focused on choosing a strategy that was suitable for the teaching duration of Moral Education slot. The findings of this study showed that the participants planned their activities according to the teaching duration of either 30 or 60 minutes. The participants selected strategies that were easier to implement in the 30-minute slot teaching compared to the 60-minute. Activity planning was varied in 60-minute slot teaching. This was proven based on the following interview statements.

“usually, if I teach for 60 minutes, I do the activity of watching video, then they can do acting or handicrafts. If it has nothing to do with the video, they can make animal-themed masks. Yes. There is an integration with art” (GP1)

In summary, the findings of this study indicated that the participants selected appropriate and varied teaching strategies according to the students. The selected strategy also focused on teaching certain values according to the annual lesson plans. In addition, the participants took into account the duration of the slot teaching in selecting the appropriate strategy to not burden the students in achieving the teaching objectives.

Use of Teaching Aids

The use of teaching aids is essential in assisting students to develop the concept of new knowledge. From the findings of interview, observation and document analysis, two sub-themes were identified for teaching aid resources, namely resource materials for teachers and also students. The description of the sub-themes is summarized in Table 4.

Table 4

Resource materials

Sub-theme	Type	GP1	GP2	GP3	GP4
Resource materials for teachers	Existing materials	/	/	/	/
	Still picture card	/	/	/	/
	Film clips	-	-	-	/
	Cartoon video	/	/	/	/
	Song video	/	/	-	-
Resource materials for students	Moral Education exercise book	-	/	/	/
	Printed worksheets	/	/	-	-
	Online worksheets	/	/	-	/

Based on the findings of this study, five types of resource materials for teachers were identified, such as existing materials, still picture cards, film clips, cartoon videos, and song videos that were adapted according to teaching implementation. All participants used cartoon videos and song videos as their resource materials to attract students' interest. The cartoon videos were selected based on the topic of teaching related to moral values. This was proven based on the interview statement below.

“Many cartoon videos were taken from YouTube source, but we need to find suitable and interesting materials for them, and must be based on pure values....I always let them watch such videos” (GP1)

“Normal activities can use YouTube. YouTube videos. It's nice to teach kindness and there are a lot of songs....it's okay...so most of the videos are stories made up by other people...for example, cartoon stories about animals..and songs” (GP2)

Furthermore, the research participants also used resource materials from existing materials, such as fruits (e.g. oranges), and still picture cards, such as situational picture cards and fruit cards. This can be proven based on observations and document analysis of pictures of teaching aids used by teachers. It was found that the participants prepared picture cards appropriate to the teaching topic before commencing the teaching slot. They utilized materials available in the classroom, such as A4 paper, to prepare the cards. Pictures were taken from internet sources and Moral Education textbooks of Year 1. This was proven in the observation as in the following statements:

The teacher took an orange to demonstrate to the students how to wash the fruit using tap water, and tap water can be reused by washing floors, cars and so on.(GP4)

Also, from the document analysis GP4 proved that

Teachers used various teaching aids in teaching sessions. The use of ICT materials, such as learning videos in Tamil language from Youtube, and some fruit and situation picture cards. The fruit picture card was in large size, while the situation picture card was in small size because the picture could not be enlarged as it was photocopied from mainstream Islamic Education textbooks.

Among the four participants interviewed, only GP4 used film clips in Tamil language in the Moral Education slot. The purpose was to attract interest and facilitate students' understanding of the concept of value.

“Using film, it's easy because there is a situation. Easy for students to understand..” (GP4)

In addition, Moral Education exercise books, printed worksheets and online worksheets were used as resource materials for students.

“For worksheets, some I made myself using live worksheets because there weren't many students.. so it's ok..” (GP2)

“For written sources, there are books. There are two or three publishers who make books but the books are more about coloring. Color, connect the lines, so the moral is made in theory” (GP4)

This is supported by the following observations:

The teacher gave worksheets to each student to do in their respective workspaces. Explanations were provided on how to complete the worksheet. Assistance was given to each student in completing the assigned task. The teacher instructed the students to send the worksheet and then to be checked together.

In summary, the participants used more resource materials for teachers to facilitate the teaching of values in the Moral Education slot. Meanwhile, the resource materials for students

were taken from sources, such as exercise books, printed worksheets and online worksheets for teaching values.

Writing of Teaching Objectives

Based on the findings of this study, three sub-themes were formulated, namely format of the daily lesson plan, suitable for various students, and the delivery of objectives. The description of the subthemes is summarized in Table 5.

Table 5

Subthemes of writing teaching objectives

No.	Sub-theme	Criteria	GP1	GP2	GP3	GP4
1	Format of daily lesson plan	References from NSPC Curriculum, annual lesson plan, and theme annual plan	/	/	/	/
		Template from State Education Department	/	/	/	/
2	Suitable for Various Students	Easy to reach and according to the student's suitability	/	/	/	/
3	Delivery of Objectives	Form of delivery				
		- Written	/	/	-	-
		- Oral	-	-	/	/
		According to Moral Education slot time	/	/	/	/

From interviews and document analysis of daily lesson plan (RPH), it was found that all participants used the RPH template provided by the State Education Department (JPN). In writing the objectives accurately, all participants referred to the NSPC document, annual lesson plan (RPT) and theme annual plan. Objectives were written based on reference to learning standards for the topic to be taught. All participants wrote their teaching objectives before implementing the teaching session. During teaching, evaluation of the objectives was performed based on the outcomes of the teaching to students. Objective writing according to the format was evidenced by the following interview statements.

“Okay..before I teach, I will refer to the theme first. I will look at the theme of the week and what I will teach. After that, I will refer to annual lesson plan and NSPK document to plan my daily lesson plan and make sure the learning standard that will be taught. Then, I will plan the activity and write according to the JPN template” (GP1)

This was supported by the document analysis of daily lesson plan for each participant as follows:

The teachers prepared a complete RPH in line with RPT for the state of Melaka and guided by Curriculum and Assessment Standard Document (DSKP) Preschool Revision 2017. The teaching steps were stated in an orderly manner and according to the criteria of the activities to be

carried out. Teachers referred to learning standard and content standard according to NSPK document and annual lesson plan documents.

Furthermore, the participants of GP1, GP2, GP3 and GP4 also agreed that each objective was written according to the suitability of various students. This was proven based on the statement below.

“The objective to be achieved is not too difficult, it means that you have to follow the suitability of the student to achieve it.” (GP2)

Findings from the analysis of interviews and observations showed that all participants delivered their teaching objectives but in different forms either in writing or orally. Teaching objectives were delivered to students in the Moral Education teaching slot. This was proven from the statement by GP2 as follows:

“Sometimes we have to display on the notice board...we have to write...actually we have to write every single slot. After that, delete the second slot and write the objective with the success criteria on how to achieve the objective...” (GP2)

GP1 also supported the above view as stated below.

“... during the induction set, you can talk to them about what they should get today...” (GP1)

From the observation, it was identified that all participants delivered the objectives in the initial phase of teaching either in the form of writing on the white board or explained verbally to all students before commencing the teaching which focused on the topic of moral values. The findings from the observation are as follows.

Objectives were written and displayed on the white board in front of the class. The teacher asked questions related to the topic and the students' daily lives. Students answered by applying their situations and experiences at home.

In summary, participants have high level of understanding in writing teaching objectives. Objectives were written according to appropriate guidelines, suitable for various students and clearly delivered to each student in the Moral Education slot.

Obstacles in Planning and Implementation

The theme of obstacles in planning was a new discovery in this study. Three sub-themes were identified, namely obstacles from teachers, students and resources. Among the obstacles was the lack of training related to Moral Education for each participant. The teachers were only involved in workshops, such as Civic Education workshop, eight multiple intelligence workshop, and other workshop held every year. The participants took the initiative by linking Moral Education to the content of workshops they had attended before. This was proved by the following statement.

“ Previously, I have attended courses or training related to SIVIK and the most recent one was eight multiple intelligence workshop. There was an improvement in the moral level. Civic

workshop was organized by JPN or PPD ... there was no workshop for moral education but it can be related to other workshops.” (GP1)

As a result, GP3 and GP4 participants explained their difficulty in planning lessons more effectively as stated below.

“Sometimes I didn't know how to explain about values..and it would be good if there were courses and workshops specifically for Moral Education..” (GP3)

Preschoolers were also an obstacle for research participants. The low level of preschoolers understanding created difficulties for teachers to understand the concept of value, especially non-integrated values. The gap in the communication language also affected the teaching of Moral Education. The use of daily or informal Tamil language at home made it difficult for students to understand the concept of value in formal Tamil language at school. During the teaching of Moral Education, preschoolers have difficulty in understanding some of the terms mentioned by the teacher. This was evidenced by the following interview statement.

“ Another one is tolerance, like touching their emotions. I have to teach them because they don't understand. If they do it, immediately say okay. If we keep talking about tolerance, they will ask what is that? we don't know...”(GP1)

Moreover, lack of resources became an obstacle for the participants based on the following interview statements.

“Teaching aids, such as flashcards, are not available in Tamil. Not only Moral Education, even for Tamil language there is no teaching aids... it's very difficult to get it... you have to look here and there the teacher has to take the initiative... but sometimes it's just a waste of time because you can't find it.. I also asked the supplier for a catalog for the Tamil language..not many.” (GP3)

Findings from observation and document analysis also supported interview analysis. It was found that the participants used small-sized situation picture cards as the teachers could not find situational pictures to illustrate a value. The existing picture source was obtained from the Islamic Education textbook of Year 1 which could not be enlarged as stated below.

Teachers used various teaching aids in teaching sessions, for example ICT materials, such as learning videos in Tamil language from YouTube, and some fruit and situation picture cards. Fruit picture cards were large in size, while situation picture cards were small in size because the pictures could not be enlarged as they were taken from mainstream Islamic Education textbooks. In addition, the teacher used worksheets as teaching aids for the closing activity.

In summary, the participants planned and implemented lessons referring to the NSPC document and adapted according to their own understanding. Practices were performed regularly to ensure the ease of the Moral Education slot teaching in terms of selecting teaching techniques, teaching strategies, and use of appropriate teaching aids as well as the writing of teaching objectives accurately and according to the students' level of understanding.

However, there were also obstacles in the planning and implementation of teaching that teachers need to overcome to ensure the effectiveness of the Moral Education slot.

Discussion

The planning and implementation process of teaching is essential for teachers to ensure that their teaching slot runs steadily. The opinions of the four participants in the practice of planning and implementation could be formulated based on five themes: (a) teaching methods, (b) teaching strategies, (c) use of teaching aids, and (d) writing of teaching objectives. The theme of obstacles in the practice of planning and implementation was a new discovery in this study. The participants faced obstacles from teachers, students and resources.

In this study, it was revealed that question-and-answer, simulation, discussion and storytelling methods were the most widely used methods in teaching Moral Education. All participants often used simulation and discussion methods in the Moral Education teaching slot. The use of teaching methods in the classroom demonstrated its suitability in providing students an understanding of the concept of value learned. The findings of this study are supported by (Syahirah & Aderi, 2022; Pratama et al., 2015; Abiddin & Ismail, 2016). These previous studies stated that the discussion method in the Moral Education teaching slot has the advantages of increasing students' motivation and understanding of a topic as well as encouraging more active and friendly interaction among students.

In addition, the participants used the storytelling method in planning the Moral Education slot. Teaching values through storytelling can also increase students' interest in learning. The findings are in line with that of Balakrishnan and Thambu (2017), asserting that the storytelling method has a positive effect on the participants, and the researcher's presence in the preschool classroom was awaited by students to hear various moral stories. In this study, all participants applied the strategies recommended by the ministry. There are nine teaching strategies for preschool level, including learning while playing strategy, project-based strategy, student-centered strategy, integrated approach strategy and themed approach strategy (Ministry of Education, 2017).

Student-centered strategy was the main choice of participants in this study. Among the activities involved in the implementation of student-centered strategy were tidying and cleaning individual desk spaces. The findings are in line with that reported by Aliza and Zamri (2017) that preschool teachers tend to implement teaching based on student-centered strategy at the preschool level due to high levels of curiosity and enthusiasm of students in exploring their surroundings.

In the integrated approach strategy, the participants identified the integration of moral values, pillars and other subjects in the Moral Education slot that may increase the effectiveness of teaching. For the discussion of the third theme, particularly the use of teaching aids, there were two resource materials used in the teaching of Moral Education, such as resource materials for teachers and preschoolers. The resource materials for teachers assisted teachers in delivering the value concepts to preschoolers, while resource materials for preschoolers assisted them to understand concepts more clearly. Various resource materials for teachers

were used, such as existing materials, still picture cards, film clips, cartoon videos and song videos.

Participants were more likely to use song videos, cartoon videos and picture cards in the Moral Education slot to stimulate preschoolers' understanding more clearly. Rabaah et al (2021) explained that teaching aids used by teachers are advantageous to preschoolers in stimulating their focus to learn. Exercise books and online worksheets were also often used by teachers as materials for preschoolers. Connie (2021) supported the use of exercise books and worksheets in teaching at the preschool level as they do need the attention of adults to help them master a skill.

On another note, Akhiar and Shamsina (2016) explained that the first step in planning lessons is to write teaching objectives. In this study, all participants wrote objectives with reference to NSPC document, annual lesson plan and theme annual plans. Objective writing must follow the daily lesson plan writing template specified by JPN. In addition, all participants wrote objectives appropriate to the diversity of students. In fact, the objectives to be achieved by students in the slot were delivered to them verbally or written. The objectives were written in a specific space on the whiteboard. Johdi (2007) argued that the teaching objectives need to be explained to the preschoolers and must be according to the achievement level of the preschoolers in the classroom.

Overall, the findings found that the participants were willing to plan and implement teaching in an organized and focused manner. They were also creative in applying teaching methods, strategies and using teaching aids that were suitable for Moral Education slot. Nevertheless, obstacles in the practice of planning and implementation needed to be overcome that stemmed from obstacles from teachers, preschoolers or resources. Among the obstacles from teachers was lack of training received by teachers related to Moral Education. As a result, they were uncertain in selecting teaching methods or strategies that were suitable for preschool students.

Therefore, it is recommended that workshops and briefings related to Moral Education can be organized by relevant parties for preschool teachers in particular. In addition, the lack of teaching aids can be overcome by organizing relevant workshops to innovate new materials with preschool teachers in other districts for use in teaching at the preschool level.

Conclusion

Teachers play a role in planning and implementing effective teaching for preschoolers that can lead to positive behavior changes in themselves. Among the practices of planning and implementation by teachers based on the research findings were selecting appropriate teaching methods and strategies, using compelling teaching aids, and able to write teaching objectives accurately as well as focusing on teaching. The implication of this study is to be a guide for preschool teachers to face various challenges with solid mastery of knowledge and teaching planning skills, and to implement teaching in an orderly manner so that its objectives can be delivered to preschoolers effectively. Novice preschool teachers also benefit from this study through the sharing of information related to the selection of appropriate teaching methods and strategies for students. Moreover, this study also gives implications to certain parties such as ministries, JPN or PPD to organize relevant workshops, briefings or programs related to Moral Education. Such efforts can assist teachers in providing the best teaching

methods for their students. For further research, it is suggested to explore assessment practices during the Moral Education slot. In addition, future studies can look into the design and selection of other study locations to obtain more comprehensive outcomes.

References

- Abdul-Adil, J. K., & Farmer, A. D. (2006). Inner-City African American Parental Involvement in Elementary Schools: Getting beyond Urban legends of Apathy. *School Psychology Quarterly* 21(1), 1-12.
- Abiddin, N. Z., & Ismail, A. (2016). Peranan Fasilitator dalam Perbincangan Kumpulan Kelas: Ke Arah Pembangunan Pelajar di Institusi Pengajian Tinggi. *Mimbar Pendidikan*, 1(1).
- Akhiar, P., & Shamsina, S. (2016). *Rancangan Pengajaran Harian*. Petaling Jaya: Sasbadi Sdn. Bhd.
- Aliza, A., & Zamri, M. (2017). Analisis keperluan Terhadap Pengguna Sasaran Modul Pendekatan Berasaskan Bermain bagi Pengajaran dan Pembelajaran kemahiran Bahasa Kanak-kanak Prasekolah. *Jurnal Kurikulum dan Pengajaran Asia Pasifik*, 3(1), 1-8.
- Amatea, E. S., & West, C. A. (2007). Joining The Conversation About Educating Our Poorest Children: Emerging leadership Roles For School Counselors in High Poverty Schools. *Professional School Counseling* 11(2), 81–89.
- Balakrishnan, V., & Thambu, N. (2017). Using moral and ethical stories to inculcate values among Preschoolers. *International Journal for Studies on Children, Women, Elderly and Disabled*, (2), 8-15.
- Balakrishnan, V. (2010). Transformation in education in Malaysia: A look into moral education syllabus. *i-manager's Journal on School Educational Technology*, 6(2), 14-19.
- Budi, M. (2014). Model pendidikan karakter dalam masyarakat jepang. *Jurnal Bahasa, Sastra dan Budaya Jepang*, 3(1), 69-80.
- Budi, M. (2020). Early Childhood Character Education in Japan. 5th International Conference On Energy, Environment, Epidemiology and Information System (Online Conference) 12-13 Ogos.
- Connie, C. O. (2021). 2021. Penggunaan Kaedah Permainan, Buku Nombor dan Lembaran Kerja dalam Pembelajaran Matematik Awal Kanak-kanak. *Malaysian Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 6(10), 235-251.
- Danielson, C. (1996). *Enhancing Profesional Practice A Framework For Teaching*. Alexandria: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.
- Ghazali, D., & Sufean, H. (2018). *Metodologi Penyelidikan dalam Pendidikan. Amalan dan Analisis Kajian Edisi Kedua*. Kuala Lumpur: Penerbit Universiti Malaya.
- Haris, Z., & Kassim, M. K. A. (2016). Pendidikan Islam Kursus Perguruan Lepas Ijazah di Institut Pendidikan Guru Malaysia: Kaedah dan Proses Pengajaran dan Pembelajaran yang Berkesan. *ATIKAN*, 1(2), 279–294.
- Kementerian Pendidikan Malaysia. (2016). *Buku Panduan Guru Pelaksanaan Kurikulum Standard Prasekolah Kebangsaan Semakan 2017*. Putrajaya: Bahagian Perkembangan Kurikulum.
- Kementerian Pendidikan Malaysia. (2017). *Dokumen Standard Kurikulum dan Pentaksiran Prasekolah Semakan 2017*. Putrajaya: Bahagian Pembangunan Kurikulum.
- Kementerian Perpaduan Negara. (2021). *Pelan Pendidikan Awal Kanak-kanak 2021-2030*. Putrajaya.

- Maila, D. H. R., Nur Surayyah, M. A., & Husni, R. (2012). School Culture and the Moral Development of Children International Proceedings of Economics Development and Research, 56(32).
- Maila, R., Surayyah, N. M. A., Steven, E. K., & Husni, R. (2020). Moral Education through Dramatized Storytelling: Insights and Observations from Indonesia Kindergarten Teachers. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*, 19(3), 475-490.
- Mardziah, A., Mariani, M. N., & Fonny, D. H. (2021). Pendekatan pengajaran bermain di bilik darjah dalam kalangan guru prasekolah. *Jurnal Penyelidikan Pendidikan*, 39, 64-74.
- Mastura, A. R., Rozita, R. S., & Fathiyah, M. F. (2021). Analisis Penulisan Objektif Menggunakan Konsep "Smart" dalam Rancangan Pelajaran Harian Bakal Guru BPBM bagi Mata Pelajaran Kesusasteraan Melayu Komunikatif. *International Journal of Education and Training (InjET)*, 7(2), 1-12.
- Merriam, S. B. (2016). *Qualitative Research A guide to design and implementation Fourth Edition*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Johdi, M. H. S. (2007). Guru Efektif dan Peranan Guru dalam Mencapai Objektif Persekolahan Sekolah Rendah: Perspektif Guru Besar. Seminar Penyelidikan Pendidikan Institut Perguruan Batu Lintang Tahun 2007.
- Faez, M. I., Julia, M., Izzuddin, M. P., Annasai, J., & Murihah, A. (2022). Analisa faktor halangan guru pendidikan islam sekolah bestari dalam penggunaan bahan bantu mengajar Sains Humanika, 14(2), 64-70.
- Mok, S. S. (2011). *Pedagogi untuk Pengajaran dan Pembelajaran*. Puchong: Penerbitan Multimedia Sdn. Bhd.
- Hadibah, N. H., & Zulkifli, O. (2020). Pelaksanaan amalan terbaik pengajaran bahasa melayu dalam kalangan guru sekolah rendah. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Melayu*, 10(1), 1-13.
- Shahida, N. M. (2020). Keberkesanan Pengajaran Guru Prasekolah Bagi Mencapai Strategi Pengajaran: Satu Kajian Kes di Negeri Perak dan Selangor. Tesis Sarjana, Fakulti Pembangunan Manusia, Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris.
- Syahirah, N. A. B., & Aderi, M. C. N. (2022). Kaedah Perbincangan dalam Pengajaran Pendidikan Islam di Sekolah Rendah. *Jurnal Pendidikan Nusantara*, 1(1), 89-99.
- Norhazira, A. R., Sahril, A., & Aijratul, N.A. (2021). Minat dan sikap pelajar terhadap penggunaan bahan bantu mengajar dalam pembelajaran dan pemudahcaraan (PdPC) dalam pendidikan jasmani. *Malaysian Online Journal of Education*, 5(2), 77-86.
- Syafiqah, N. I., & Nazirah, N. M. I. M. (2018). Keberkesanan penggunaan grafik berkomputer sebagai alat bahan bantu mengajar dalam kalangan pelajar reka bentuk dan teknologi. *Jurnal Sains Humanika*, 10(3-3), 81-87.
- Nuraishahtun, M. A., Zamri, M., Siti Faraziah, M. A., & Norshiha, H. S. (2019). Pelaksanaan modul pedagogi terbeza Sekolah Agama Bantuan Kerajaan (SABK) dalam pengajaran dan pembelajaran Bahasa Melayu. Prosiding Seminar Kebangsaan Pendidikan Negara (SKEPEN) Ke-6. Fakulti Pendidikan, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, 21-22 September.
- Pratama, H., Azman, M. N. A., Mustapha, R., Rahman, A. A., & Rus, R. C. (2015). Keberkesanan Kaedah Pembelajaran Berasaskan DD/CT Terhadap Kecerdasan Emosi Pelajar Sekolah Menengah di Banda Aceh. *Sains Humanika*, 7(1), 19-29.
- Pusat Pendidikan Hong Kong. (2022). *Moral Education Hong Kong*. <https://www.edb.gov.hk/en/index.html>. [18 DECEMBER 2023].

- Rabaah, A., an Noorlizawati, W. M. A., & Adnan, J. (2021). Penggunaan bahan bantu mengajar (BBM) dalam subjek tema “penjajahan di asia tenggara pada abad ke-19”. *Jurnal Perspektif*, 13(1), 1-13.
- Rukiyati, Siswoyo, D., & Hendrowibowo, L. (2020). Moral Education of Kindergarten Children in Rural Areas: A Case Study in Indonesia. *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change*, 14(3), 1278- 1293.
- Saemah, R., & Zamri, M. (2017). Inovasi dalam pengajaran dan pembelajaran: Mengoptimumkan pembelajaran pelajar. Kuala Lumpur: Penerbit Dewan Bahasa dan Pustaka.
- Suppiah, N., Barathy, S., & Sandra, S. (2017). Masalah dalam pengajaran dan pembelajaran pendidikan moral di sekolah menengah dan penyelesaian masalah melalui kaedah hermeneutik. *Journal of Research, Policy & Practice of Teachers & Teacher Education*, 7(2), 58-68.
- Kamaruzaman, S. A., Parwazalam, A. R., & Norkhalid, S. (2017). Hubungan Antara Pengalaman Mengajar dan Perancangan Pengajaran Dalam Kalangan Guru Pendidikan Jasmani. *International Journal of Education, Psychology and Counseling* 2(6): 268-277.
- Sylvester, R. P. (2021). Pelaksanaan Pengajaran Dan Pembelajaran Berpusatkan Kanak-Kanak Dalam Kalangan Guru Tabika Kemas Di Zon Selatan. Tesis Sarjana. Fakulti Pembangunan Manusia. Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris.
- Tofteland, B. (2018). The Valueable Index Index Finger: Communicating Democratic Values Through Pointing. In E. Johansson, A. Emilson & A. Puroila (Eds). *Values Education in Early Childhood Settings*, 281-296. Springer International Publishing AG.
- Vasanthan, G. (2019). Penggunaan Teknik Pembikinan Filem Pendek Dalam Pengajaran Dan Pembelajaran Pendidikan Moral Di Sekolah Menengah. Tesis Dr Fal. Fakulti Sains Kemanusiaan. Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris.
- Woolfolk, A. E. (1998). *Educational Psychology Seventh Edition*. USA: Allan and Bacon.
- Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case Study Rearch and Applications Design and Method*. California: SAGE Publications, Inc.