The Systematic Literature Review of Corruption Management Strategies

Khairol Anuar Kamri, Aizathul Hani Abd Hamid, Razi Jaafar, Mohd Yazid Abd Aziz
Centre for General Studies and Co-curricular, Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia
Malaysia

Abstract

The objective of this article is to identify strategies for corruption management through a Systematic Literature Review (SLR). This article uses a systematic literature review method to collect the results of five years of previous studies and systematically develop themes. The PICo formulation is used to construct the research questions in this article. Then, the PRISMA framework was used as a guideline for the review process. The articles collected for review in this paper were carefully extracted from the Scopus and Google Scholar databases. A review of 41 articles can relate some strategies that need to be done by some specific parties, such as government and governance, education, society, technology usage, law, and agencies. This article can be implemented for policy recommendations, training and education, and also risk assessment. This article has shown the research gaps in corruption management strategies around the world in the previous five years.

Keywords: Corruption, Management, Strategies

Introduction

Corruption is a pervasive global issue that adversely affects society, the economy, and governance systems. It involves the abuse of entrusted power, usually for personal gain, at the expense of the public interest and the common good. Corruption can take many forms, including bribery, embezzlement, nepotism, fraud, and extortion (Esoimeme, 2019). There are several factors that result in widespread corruption. These factors are divided into two, namely external factors and internal factors. Internal factors that cause a person to commit corruption are due to the existence of opportunities, personal weaknesses, and lack of integrity. External factors are caused by low wages, financial pressure, and work pressure as well as less effective national policies (Bautista-Beauchesne & Garzon, 2019).

As a result, corruption has undermined the principles of transparency, accountability, and justice in both the public and private sectors (Zigo & Vincent, 2021). Corruption has eroded trust in institutions, distorted market competition, hindered economic development, and
perpetuated social inequality. The effects of corruption are also seen in reduced public services, compromised infrastructure projects, improper allocation of resources, and the breakdown of the rule of law (Nugroho et al., 2022). Furthermore, corruption also occurs in different contexts and at various levels, from grassroots interactions to high-level political affairs. It can be prevalent in government administration, law enforcement agencies, business enterprises, educational institutions, health care systems, and so on (Radin, 2019).

Thus, combating corruption requires a comprehensive approach that involves legal frameworks, institutional reforms, and a culture of integrity. Governments, international organizations, civil society, and the private sector play an important role in the fight against corruption. This involves drafting and enforcing anti-corruption laws, establishing independent anti-corruption agencies, promoting transparency and accountability, and fostering a culture of ethics and integrity (Adnan, 2021). At the international level, international initiatives, such as the United Nations Convention Against Corruption (UNCAC) have provided a framework for countries to work together to tackle corruption collectively (Sakib, 2020). This initiative promotes cooperation, information sharing, and capacity building to strengthen anti-corruption efforts around the world.

In addition, raising awareness and empowering the people is important in the fight against corruption (Sanusi & Ismail, 2016). Education, the media, and civil society organizations play an important role in informing the public about the ill effects of corruption and mobilizing collective action to demand transparency, accountability, and good governance. In short, overcoming corruption is an ongoing challenge that requires continuous commitment and collective action (Adnan, 2021). By tackling corruption, society can build trust, promote economic growth, ensure equal opportunities, and create a fair and inclusive system of governance.

Therefore, to eradicate the symptoms of corruption from spreading, many approaches have been implemented at various levels. Therefore, this study will identify what strategies have been used in past studies to control the issue of corruption in their studies. This study will find the answer through a systematic search for literature highlights from studies conducted in 2019-2023.

Methodology
This study is qualitatively a method of systematic literature review based on the findings of previous studies that go through a screening process in identifying and critically evaluating to obtain the results of the study.

Formulation of the Research Question
The research question was developed using two sources. Concepts from previous research were selected through a search and screening process. All previous articles are about anti-corruption strategies. Then, the PICo method uses mnemonics that mean "P" (population or problem), "I" (interest), and "Co" (context). To build a research question based on the PICo concept, this study combines three important elements. Symptoms of rampant corruption (problem) and variables related to anti-corruption and strategy (Interest) and worldwide
population (context) are elements that need to be discussed. Therefore, the research question of what are the anti-corruption strategy research applied around the world is discussed in this article.

**Searching Strategies**
This section will go through and describe the methods used to extract information from articles that are closely related to strategies to combat widespread corruption. The PRISMA method used includes the collection and filtering of article sources by selecting eligibility and exclusion criteria. A systematic review was also conducted, including identification, screening and qualification, data extraction, and content analysis.

**PRISMA**
The PRISMA Statement Guidelines, Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews, and Meta-Analyses were used for the review. PRISMA defines clear research questions that enable a systematic review, i.e. filtering the articles that have been identified through inclusion and exclusion criteria based on the research question to quickly examine a large database. Using PRISMA allows a thorough search related to strategies to combat the widespread symptoms of corruption.

**Resources**
Article search sources are done through journal databases, namely Scopus and Google Scholar. Google Scholar was used for systematic review article searches. Google Scholar was launched in 2004 offering a variety of literature from various fields. Scopus is used to find articles related to the research question. Scopus was launched in 2004 and has over 10,000 publishers worldwide. The method used to find articles is through self-selection that includes inclusion and exclusion criteria based on the eligibility of the article.

**Eligibility and Exclusion Criteria**
Only journal articles were selected for this study. Review articles, books, book series, and book chapters are not included. Then, the search uses only English-language publications. As there are many articles on “anti-corruption”, this review focuses only on the most recent five-year publication (2019-2023). Finally, this study only looks at strategies associated with widespread corruption symptoms in various countries.
Table 1
Search String For Identification Process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Database</th>
<th>Search String</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scopus</td>
<td>TITLE-ABS-KEY ( anti-corruption ) AND ( LIMIT-TO ( SRCTYPE , &quot;j&quot; ) ) AND ( LIMIT-TO ( PUBSTAGE , &quot;final&quot; ) ) AND ( LIMIT-TO ( DOCTYPE , &quot;ar&quot; ) ) AND ( LIMIT-TO ( SUBJAREA , &quot;SOCI&quot; ) OR LIMIT-TO ( SUBJAREA , &quot;ARTS&quot; ) ) AND ( LIMIT-TO ( PUBYEAR , 2019 ) OR LIMIT-TO ( PUBYEAR , 2020 ) OR LIMIT-TO ( PUBYEAR , 2021 ) OR LIMIT-TO ( PUBYEAR , 2022 ) OR LIMIT-TO ( PUBYEAR , 2023 ) ) AND ( LIMIT-TO ( LANGUAGE , &quot;English&quot; ) ) AND ( LIMIT-TO ( EXACTKEYWORD , &quot;Corruption&quot; ) ) OR LIMIT-TO ( EXACTKEYWORD , &quot;Anti-corruption&quot; ) ) OR LIMIT-TO ( EXACTKEYWORD , &quot;Crime&quot; ) ) OR LIMIT-TO ( EXACTKEYWORD , &quot;Integrity&quot; ) OR LIMIT-TO ( EXACTKEYWORD , &quot;Bribery&quot; ) )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Google Scholar</td>
<td>( &quot;Anti-corruption&quot; )</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2
Eligibility and Exclusion Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Eligibility</th>
<th>Exclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Type of document</td>
<td>Journal Article</td>
<td>Book, Book Series, Chapter in book</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Non-English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publication Timeline</td>
<td>2019-2023</td>
<td>&lt;2019</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Systematic Review Process**

There are several stages in the systematic review process as shown in Figure 1 below.

![PRISMA Model](image)

The first stage is Identification. At this stage, keywords for the search process are identified. Based on the literature review, previous research, and thesaurus, keywords similar to and related to anti-corruption have been used as in Figure 1. At this level, there are 20 similar articles found for exclusion.

The second stage was Screening, where 2922 out of 3271 articles were excluded based on the type of literature and language, non-article type, publication timeline, and article availability. The third level is Eligibility, where the full article has been checked. After a full inspection, a total of 186 articles were removed because they were not related and did not focus on strategies to combat widespread symptoms of corruption. Finally, a total of 41 articles were included for review and qualitative analysis.

**Data Abstraction and Analysis**

41 articles were examined and analyzed in full. The analysis focused on studies that answered the research questions for this review. The results were obtained by reading the abstract and then examining the full article for in-depth reading to obtain the anti-corruption strategy information found in the article. Next, content analysis is used to identify themes related to strategies related to the eradication of widespread corruption.

**Result**

The latest five-year research has identified that there are as many as 6 main strategies that can be implied to eradicate the widespread symptoms of corruption and as many as 21 sub-strategies have been classified based on the six main strategies. The six main anti-corruption strategies are Government and Public Administration, Education, Society and Public, Use of Technology, Law, and Agency.

The first strategy related to the eradication of widespread corruption is through the efforts of
the Government and Public Administration. Under the Government and Public Administration strategy, there are 6 sub-strategies. The six sub-strategies are Good Governance, Organizing Anti-corruption Programs, Increasing Accountability, Establishing Anti-corruption Corporations and Bureaus, Open Government and Anti-corruption Policies and Plans. The second strategy related to anti-corruption is through Education. Under the Education strategy, there are 3 sub-strategies. The three sub-strategies are Integration, Ethics and Character Development, Anti-corruption Education, and Increasing Awareness and Understanding of Corruption.

Next, 3 sub-strategies have been classified under the Society, namely Organizing Seminars and Campaigns, Religious Interventions and Community Organisation. The fourth strategy related to anti-corruption is the use of technology. Technology Use Strategy has been classified into 2 sub-strategies, namely through the Use of Tools, Computers and Applications, and the Use of Modern Machines. The fifth strategy in anti-corruption is Law. The Legal Strategy is divided into 5 sub-strategies, namely Introducing the Bill, Enforcement of the Law, Improving the Law, Strengthening the Punishment and Reforming the Law. The sixth strategy related to the eradication of widespread corruption is through the efforts of the Agency. The Agency's strategy can be divided into 2 sub-strategies, namely "Whistleblowing" Information Disclosure Policy and Self-Involvement in Anti-Corruption Policies and Plans approved by the government and public administration.

A total of 41 research collection articles were published between 2019 and 2023. Of those articles, there is only 1 article published in 2023, 7 articles published in 2022, 2 articles published in 2021, 14 articles published in 2020, and 15 articles published in 2019. This research links anti-corruption with strategies to combat widespread corruption symptoms through a qualitative approach (18 article collections), a quantitative approach (13 article collections), and a mixed qualitative and quantitative approach (9 article collections).

Research related to strategies to combat this widespread corruption is carried out in any country. Based on our findings, the highest number of collections of articles related to the title is carried out in Russia and Indonesia, each of which has as many as 4 articles. Next, the number of collections of articles related to the second highest title is carried out in Nigeria, the USA, and Ukraine, each of which has 3 articles. The third highest number of collections of articles related to the title was recorded by Italy, Australia, Croatia, China, Bangladesh, and Malaysia, with 2 articles each. The remaining studies are in ASEAN countries, Thailand, Arkansas, Central and Eastern Europe, Somalia, the Caribbean, and Hong Kong with only one article, which is at least one.

Table 3 shows the main anti-corruption strategies and sub-strategies found and associated with strategies to combat widespread corruption based on 41 studies that have been conducted from 2019 to 2023. Of the 6 main strategies found, the 3 highest main strategies associated with the eradication of widespread corruption are the strategy of Government and Public Administration (48.78%), Law (41.46%), and Education (31.71%). Meanwhile, the 3 lowest main strategies found are Society (24.39%), Agency (14.63%), and Technology Use (12.20%) strategies.

Under the Government and Public Administration strategy, the three highest sub-strategies associated with the strategy of combating widespread corruption are Anti-Corruption Policy and Plan (60.00%), Establishment of Anti-Corruption Corporation and Bureau (35.00%), and Open Government (30.00%). The three lowest sub-strategies associated with the strategy of
In addition, under the Society strategy, the highest sub-strategy associated with the strategy of combating widespread corruption is Organized Seminars and Campaigns (60.00%), followed by the Religious Intervention sub-strategy (20.00%). The lowest sub-strategy associated with the strategy of combating widespread corruption under the Community and Public strategy is Community Organisation, which is 30.00%. As for the main strategy of Technology Use, the highest sub-strategy associated with the strategy of combating widespread corruption is the Use of Tools, Computers, and Applications, which is 80.00%. The lowest sub-strategy associated with the strategy of combating widespread corruption under the Use of Technology strategy is the Use of Machines, which is 20.00%.
In addition, under the Law strategy, the highest sub-strategy associated with the strategy of combating widespread corruption is Law Enforcement (47.06%) while the lowest sub-strategy associated with the strategy of combating widespread corruption is Law Improvement law (5.88%). 3 sub-strategies have a percentage value of a sub-strategy that has a moderately low percentage value under the Law strategy, namely Punishment (23.53%), Law Reform (23.53%), and Introducing Bills (17.65%). Finally, under the Agency’s strategy, there are 2 sub-strategies linked to the strategy of combating widespread corruption, namely the "Whistleblowing" Information Disclosure Policy and Self-Involvement in Anti-Corruption Policies and Plans. The two sub-strategies have the same percentage value, which is 50.00% each.

Discussion
This study includes a systematic review of the latest five-year literature on strategies to combat the widespread symptoms of corruption. The concept of corruption can be said to be a serious offense because this action is dishonest or fraudulent by the authorities. Corruption can damage the image of a country and also harm the country politically, economically, and socially. Based on the final review, 41 articles were carefully extracted from the Scopus and Google Scholar databases. Six strategies associated with combating widespread corruption were identified and divided into more than 21 subfactors.

According to this study, government and public administration rank first among the most popular anti-corruption strategies. The government plays a very important role in combating corruption because it has the power and authority to enact laws and regulations that prohibit and punish acts of corruption (Sakib, 2020). They can also establish effective corruption institutions to investigate and enforce the law. The government is also responsible for ensuring transparency and accountability in public administration to increase the people’s trust in the national administration (Cherniei et al., 2022). Education and awareness programs that touch on ethics and integrity in the community are also implemented to help form a negative perception of corruption and foster an attitude that rejects such actions.

Next is the law. The law sets clear rules and prohibitions against bribery. It defines what acts are considered corruption, including bribery, bribery, and wrongful use of power. With this law, acts of corruption can be identified and subject to legal action. Corresponding punishments and penalties are imposed on corruption offenders such as imprisonment, caning, being fired, or prevention from receiving the rights granted by the government. In addition, the law helps strengthen the justice system by ensuring that all individuals, including those in power, are under the same protection of the law. This ensures that acts of corruption cannot be done with immunity or certain privileges and that everyone is equal before the law (Pavlidis, 2021).

Education ranks third among the most popular anti-corruption strategies. Through education, ethical values and integrity can be instilled in society. Education that involves values such as honesty, justice, and good morals helps to form attitudes and behaviors that reject corruption. By encouraging a culture of integrity from the beginning, the young generation can grow up to be responsible citizens and avoid acts of corruption. Not only that, education helps form a better awareness and understanding of the negative implications of corruption on society and national development (Prabowo, 2020). With increased knowledge, individuals can recognize and avoid corrupt situations, as well as understand how damaging corruption
is to integrity and justice. Individuals who are educated about corruption will be more sensitive to the consequences of their actions and the effects caused by corrupt actions.

Conclusion
This systematic study has identified as many as six main strategies to combat the symptoms of corruption that are rampant in the community as well as the government. Among the main strategies include Government and Public Administration, Education, Society, Use of Technology, Law, and also Agencies. These six main strategies each have their sub-strategies. The Government and Public Administration Strategy has six sub-strategies, namely Good Governance, Organizing Anti-corruption Programs, Increasing Accountability, Establishing Anti-corruption Corporations and Bureaus, Open Government, and Anti-corruption Policies and Plans. A systematic study found that among these six sub-strategies, Anti-corruption Policy and Plan, Establishment of Corporations and Anti-Corruption Bureau, and Open Government are the three sub-strategies that are most applied in the anti-corruption movement.

Next in the second strategy which is Education, there are three sub-strategies Integration, Ethics and Character Development, Anti-Corruption Education, and also Raising Awareness and Understanding. The three sub-strategies have played an important role in combating widespread corruption. For the third strategy, which is Society, this systematic study found three sub-strategies, namely Organizing Seminars and Campaigns, Religious Intervention, and Community Organisation are used to eliminate the symptoms of corruption. Concerning that, in the Use of Technology, there are two sub-strategies which are the Use of Tools, Computers and Applications, and the Use of Machines used by countries when combating the symptoms of corruption. The fifth strategy is Law. In the Law strategy, there are five sub-strategies, among which are Introducing Bills, Enforcement, Improvement, Punishment, and Reform. This study has shown that the three sub-strategies that are often used for anti-corruption movements are Enforcement, Reform, and Punishment. The sixth strategy is the Agency, the strategy has two sub-strategies namely the 'Whistleblowing' Information Disclosure Policy and Self-Involvement in the Anti-Corruption Policy and the Plan has contributed to efforts to combat this widespread corruption.

Referring to this study, the government and public administration ranked first among the most popular main strategies to combat corruption. This is so because the government and public administration are government bodies that have responsibility for the governance of the country. Thus, the government and public administration can implement anti-corruption strategies more easily than other parties. In addition, the establishment of corruption institutions is also effective in investigating and enforcing the law. The government is also responsible for ensuring transparency and responsibility in public administration to increase the people's trust in the national administration. With that, education and awareness programs are also organized to instill ethics and integrity in the people themselves as well as foster an attitude that opposes corruption.

This article is a systematic literature review. The strength of this study is that it has gathered findings regarding anti-corruption strategies from previous studies around the world. This study has helped the researchers to obtain patterns and developments regarding efforts focused on combating the symptoms of corruption from around the world. In addition, this study has evaluated measures related to anti-corruption from the most to the least anti-
corruption efforts. The findings of this study have made the parties involved aware that the most frequent and effective anti-corruption efforts are through the government and public administration. However, the symptoms of corruption still need to be eradicated from other aspects such as law, education, and so on.

In conclusion, the concept of corruption can be said to be a serious offense because this action is dishonest or fraudulent by some parties. Corruption can damage the image of a country and also harm the country politically, economically, and socially. Thus, each individual plays an important role in preventing the symptoms of corruption by appreciating and translating some integrity values. The value of integrity needs to be continuously cultivated in the individual of every member of society. To cultivate these values, it is certain that the spiritual aspect needs to be continuously cared for, caressed, and fed well. Failure to take good spiritual care will cause the value of integrity in one's identity to be weak and fail to be embodied in daily actions or deeds. As a result, the symptoms of corruption will continue without being aggressively curbed and may become a living culture in our society. Accordingly, of course, the value of integrity is required.

In talking about efforts to deal with corruption, it is necessary to look at the root cause. Although many research findings state that the factors that lead to corruption are external factors such as financial pressure, the economy, and the high cost of living, there is another important factor that needs to be looked at, which is internal factors. Factors that make people move away from the values that should underlie their actions. Therefore, this study has found strategies that can combat the symptoms of corruption. Among those strategies is to practice high integrity values at every level of society, especially among the young generation. The young generation, especially students, are a very important asset to the country because of the country's future. Therefore, continuous efforts must always be made so that this group can become a human resource with pure values, especially a high value of integrity to ensure that the construction of civilization is successfully carried out by those who are free from corruption.

Acknowledgment
This research was supported by the Ministry of Higher Education (MOHE) through the Fundamental Research Grant Scheme (FRGS/1/2021/SS0/UTHM/02/2).

References


perangi-rasuh-20155


